

Treasury Department,

Marine-Hospital Service.

WA  
U58re  
1884

REPORT

TO THE

SECRETARY OF THE TREASURY

ON THE

ADMINISTRATION OF THE NATIONAL QUARANTINE SERVICE

AND THE

EPIDEMIC FUND.

FEBRUARY 23, 1884.

WASHINGTON:  
GOVERNMENT PRINTING OFFICE.  
1884.

WA U58re 1884

63060070R



NLM 05131226 6

NATIONAL LIBRARY OF MEDICINE





# REPORT

TO THE

## SECRETARY OF THE TREASURY

ON THE

ADMINISTRATION OF THE NATIONAL QUARANTINE SERVICE

AND THE

### EPIDEMIC FUND.

\_\_\_\_\_  
FEBRUARY 23, 1884.  
\_\_\_\_\_



WASHINGTON:

GOVERNMENT PRINTING OFFICE.

1884.

WA

U58re

1884

c.1

NATIONAL LIBRARY OF MEDICINE  
WASHINGTON, D. C.

TREASURY DEPARTMENT, }  
Document No. 550. }  
*Marine-Hospital Service.* }

## LETTER.

---

TREASURY DEPARTMENT,  
OFFICE SUPERVISING SURGEON-GENERAL U. S. M.-H. S.,  
*Washington, February 23, 1884.*

SIR: I have the honor to report, for the information of the Department, that on Thursday, February 14, and Thursday, February 21, 1884, I made the following argument in relation to the charges made that the quarantine service, as managed by this Department, was ineffective, and that it would be better managed by the National Board of Health. Certain interpolated remarks made during the progress of the argument are inserted because they bear directly upon the subject-matter. The argument was reported by Mr. John C. Rowland, a clerk and stenographer in this office.

Very respectfully, your obedient servant,

JOHN B. HAMILTON,  
*Surgeon-General M.-H. S.*

Hon. CHARLES J. FOLGER,  
*Secretary of the Treasury.*





## ARGUMENT.

---

At a meeting of the Committee on Public Health of the House of Representatives, held at the committee-room, February 14, 1884, Surgeon-General HAMILTON said:

MR. CHAIRMAN AND GENTLEMEN OF THE COMMITTEE:

I appear before you to-day in consequence of the following newspaper paragraph, which was sent out broadcast through the associated press on last Thursday evening, and appeared in the public prints of Friday, February 7:

“PUBLIC HEALTH—GRAVE CHARGES OF INEFFICIENCY AGAINST SURGEON-GENERAL HAMILTON.

“WASHINGTON, *February 7*.—The House Committee on Public Health gave a hearing to-day to members of the National Board of Health, among whom were Doctor Cabell, president, and Colonel Waring, secretary of the Board, and Doctor Verdi, of the executive committee. These gentlemen reviewed the legislation of past years with respect to the national health and the work of the National Board of Health, which they asserted has been economical and uniformly successful, and they denied the truth of the accusations made against the Board in the discussion in the House of the appropriation for its support during the last Congress.

“Colonel Waring asserted, and his colleagues indorsed his statements, that Surgeon-General Hamilton, of the Marine-Hospital Service, had been injudicious, unskilful, and unsuccessful in his quarantine work. He also charged that Doctor Hamilton, in his efforts to control public and official opinion, had been guilty of misrepresentation. The committee will give Doctor Hamilton an opportunity to reply to these charges at its meeting next week. It may be stated here that for a long time past there has been a controversy between the Board of Health officials and those of the Marine-Hospital Service, with respect to national health matters.”

Mr. BEACH. Before we enter upon this subject, I desire to say that this committee do not feel disposed to try this personal issue as to whether these charges are true or false, but will give you an opportunity of replying to them, and request that the reply be as brief as possible, so that we can get at the gist of this matter.

Surgeon-General HAMILTON. Mr. Chairman, you have simply forestalled what I was about to say. I ought to remark, in reference to

this matter, that I went to the chairman and asked a hearing immediately. He said Mr. Waring had notified me to be present. It is due to me that I should tell you about that notification. I was out of the city on official business. When I returned, Surgeon Bailhache, who is my assistant, said Colonel Waring had been to the office, and said if I had any charges to present against the National Board of Health he wanted them made right away, because he was anxious to leave the city, and wanted opportunity to reply. I did not consider that any invitation from the committee. That was simply Mr. Waring's statement.

Mr. PETTIBONE. I understand notice had been given.

The CHAIRMAN. I really do not know to what extent the notice was given.

The CLERK. I sent a notice on Tuesday afternoon of this week. No earlier notice was given.

The CHAIRMAN. Notice should have been given.

Mr. PETTIBONE. We protest against the newspaper article being charged to the committee.

Surgeon-General HAMILTON. It is easy to understand the origin of all such things. I do not think the committee did it. I waive my right to demand that they make a specific charge or charges, on account of the importance of this general question, and I have to say that what I understand to be the purpose and object of this committee is not to hear criminations and recriminations, but to learn the truth, that they may decide on what is best to be done. In learning the truth, it is necessary to say some things that may perhaps be unpleasant, but I shall not make any general charges. I might tell you of the tugs purchased by the National Board of Health—tugs known as Turner's tugs, for the reason that the naval member, on account of his nautical skill, was sent from Pittsburgh to accompany them down the Ohio river. When they got to Gallipolis, the naval member of the committee was dissatisfied with the management of the captain, and instructed him how he should hitch his tug-boats. The boat was sunk in about fifteen minutes. It was afterwards raised, however, at some expense to the Board. I state this on information. The launch of that same fleet now lies in the bottom of the Mississippi river. I don't say it was dishonest; I don't say it was "injudicious;" I simply say it was what they term in Waring's dispatch "unsuccessful and unskilful."

There was the "Selden," an old rotten canal-boat, purchased at an expense of \$3,000, utterly and absolutely worthless; has been of no service, and is now a total wreck.

Then there was the Mississippi river fleet. A great deal might be said about that if I choose to make general charges or even specific charges. When turned over to me last July, we were obliged to keep men pumping to keep some of the "fleet" afloat. The Secretary of the Treasury ordered a board of inspection to examine these boats and ascertain their condition. It was considered better for the interest of the Government to sell than to attempt to repair them. Four were sold because they could not be kept afloat except at great expense.

I might speak of my friend from Italy, Doctor Verdi. I am told he got up here the other day, and, after the manner of his countrymen, made quite a furious speech in regard to this subject. He was paid \$300 for an essay in 1879. The committee will please observe that three and a half pages out of the total eight and a half were quotations, a quotation from an editorial in the "London Times" being inserted, several columns from the Bureau of Statistics, which is at the rate of \$60 a page for the apparent original matter; and what was paid for copying the editorial can be easily figured out. That was probably an "injudicious" expenditure on the part of the Board. (Annual Report National Board of Health, 1879, page 159.)

Now for my other friend, Waring. I observe, by looking at the minutes of the Board, that "the vice-president further stated"—please notice that I am reading from the executive minutes of the board, dated October 9, 1880. "The vice-president further stated that if the committee saw fit to authorize him to do so, he would write to Colonel Waring in a guarded way [you see they thought it necessary to be guarded in writing to that individual] asking what he thought of having the experiment made in New York, and whether it would not be a saving of money.

"*Ordered*, That the matter of the proposed investigation by Colonel Waring be referred \* \* \* \* with authority to correspond in regard to the subject, and that \$500 be appropriated for said investigation in the event of its being ordered."

I find in No. 77 of the executive minutes that the vice-president reported to the committee that he had received a letter from Waring stating that he had ample facilities in Newport for conducting the investigation desired of him; that he could do the work much more cheaply there than in New York, and that \$500 would be an ample appropriation for obtaining specimens and making the investigation.

"*Ordered*, That the secretary be authorized to inform Colonel Waring that he can go forward with his proposed investigation, at a cost not to exceed \$500, and that the secretary be directed to inquire of Mr. Waring the cost of making the moulds in duplicate, that the information may be laid before the committee." It is headed "Investigation of sewer-traps, flush-tanks, &c."

I find by the records of the Patent Office that at or near that time Colonel Waring held the following patents in relation to sewers and sewer-traps:

George E. Waring, jr., Newport, R. I.:

Sewering and draining cities—No. 236,740, January 18, 1881; No. 276,839, June 5, 1883.

Flush-tank—No. 223,826, January 27, 1880.

Traps for drain, waste, and sewer pipe—No. 204,928, June 18, 1878.

Flush-pot for kitchen-sinks—No. 263,446, August 29, 1882.

Water-closet and urinal—No. 266,404, October 24, 1882.

I do not say that there was anything dishonest in regard to the matter for a board to appoint a man to investigate a subject—to report on the very things of which he was the patentee. I do not presume to say that that gentleman, in case he desired to report another man's patent as better than his own, would not do so, but presume he would do it. I leave it to the committee to judge whether he would or not.

We come now to another matter, that is in the composition of this committee, that I have the honor to address on this occasion. I have been informed, and it is within the power of the committee to ascertain whether the facts are true, that shortly after the present gentleman was elected Speaker, the president of the National Board of Health wrote a letter to the Speaker setting forth his grievances, and requesting that certain men, whom he then named, should be appointed as members of the Public Health Committee. This attempt to pack a committee is, so far as I know, unparalleled in the history of the Government. Has it come to this, that a subordinate officer of one of the executive branches of the Government has proposed to pack a Congressional committee, perhaps to deprive any gentleman holding adverse opinions to that Board of his right to a fair hearing before that committee? But these are facts which cannot be gainsaid.

They bring in evidence that the sanitarians have supported them. On what kind of sop have these sanitarians been fed? Doctor Rauch, secretary of the Illinois State board of health; Doctor Kedzie, president of the board of health of Michigan; Wirt Johnson, secretary of the Mississippi board of health, and others—all have been in the employ of the National Board of Health, as inspectors, essay-writers, or investigators, and in various other capacities, all of which accounts for the milk in that cocoa-nut.

Doctor Smart also made the following appeal to the Public Health Association that they should fly to the rescue—a cry from Macedonia to come and help:



NATIONAL BOARD OF HEALTH,  
Washington, D. C., October 4, 1882.

DEAR SIR: The action of the 47th Congress in withholding from the National Board of Health the appropriations necessary to the satisfactory performance of the duties imposed upon it by the constituting act of March 3, 1879, and the subsequent assignment of the epidemic fund, hitherto controlled by the National Board of Health, to the Marine-Hospital Service by the order of the Assistant Secretary of the Treasury, have placed the Board inferentially in an attitude of defense before the country, firstly, as to the propriety and usefulness of the work conducted under its auspices, and secondly, as to the manner in which its expenditures have been effected. \* \* \* It is equally needless to attempt a refutation of the misstatements and misrepresentations which have been made even in Congress regarding the expenditures of the Board. Its financial statements have been published from time to time, and are familiar to members of the Public Health Association.

The Board is so situated that it cannot defend itself from these implied aspersions, but must trust to the support of those who know and value its efforts in the public service to have them properly and generally appreciated. If thus appreciated, as they may be by the help of the members of the association and of medical men and sanitarians generally throughout the country, Congressional action may be influenced to do justice in the coming session to the National Board and the sanitary interests of the people.

I, as an individual solicitous for the future of sanitary legislation and progress, take the liberty of thus addressing you on behalf of the Board and the general interests connected with it, because, while cognizant of the injustice which has been done to it, of the good it has accomplished, and the difficulties under which it has labored, I have participated in none of these, and can ask for an expression of your approval, support, and influence in Congress without the hesitancy which a personal interest involves.

I am, dear sir, with much respect,

CH. SMART,

*Major and Surgeon United States Army,  
and Secretary National Board of Health.*

---

*Member American Public Health Association.*

This letter was sent in a penalty-envelope, which insures the official character of the document. It is signed "Ch. Smart, Major and Surgeon United States Army, and Secretary National Board of Health." If that is not official, I give it up.

Major SMART. It is personal.

Surgeon-General HAMILTON. He then rendered himself liable to a penalty of \$300 for sending out personal matter under penalty-envelopes. I ask the chairman and the committee to note that he says it was personal.

I now come to the facts in regard to the Texas epidemic of 1882. I understand that a comparison has been made before this committee in re-

gard to the management of this epidemic, stating that it was improperly done, and a comparison has been made between the expenses of the same by the Marine-Hospital Service and the National Board of Health at Pensacola in 1882. I find it necessary, in order to explain that matter, to go somewhat into detail in making a statement of exactly what was done. I have a map here. It must be borne in mind, so far as Pensacola is concerned, that it is a city of about 6,000 people. Brownsville has a similar population; but really this quarantine was inaugurated against a half-dozen cities, several of them having a population larger than Pensacola, and others having a population quite as large. For instance, not only was Brownsville infected by yellow-fever, but Matamoras, Tampico, Bagdad, Reynosa, Camargo, Mier, Guerrero, and all the Mexican border. This necessitated, in order to prevent its crossing into the line of Texas, the guarding of the entire river front, a distance of about five hundred miles, from Laredo, on the Upper Rio Grande river to the mouth of the same. There is no just comparison between the work done in the one place with the work done in the other. In the first place, I ought to say that this action was taken at the request of the Governor of the State of Texas. A circular was issued, which I shall read, setting forth that an epidemic fund had been placed at the disposal of the President, which he had in turn placed with the Secretary of the Treasury, and the Secretary directed that this money should be used in a State only on the application of the Governor of that State. The State of Texas had authority to establish county quarantines. She did so. Owing to lack of funds, these quarantine lines were drawn in a somewhat desultory manner, perhaps not as perfect as should be, and the State announced itself unable to bear the expense of perfecting them; consequently the lines were re-established by the United States.

At the time we took charge in Brownsville, refugees were leaving that city, and fleeing across the river from Mexico as well, and it was necessary to establish what we termed an outer line. This line extended from Laredo to Corpus Christi, on the south line of the railroad, and was about three hundred miles long. It was intended to keep it open for ten days, until we could get our forces in Brownsville, the surgeons' supplies, &c. The shorter quarantine line being established, then the upper line would be discontinued. That line was therefore established as a preliminary measure. Refugees were stopped and examined. Some actually had yellow fever while travelling on this road, extending from Brownsville to Corpus Christi. They were isolated by Doctor Spohn's order. In the mean time, a revenue-cutter stationed at Galveston was directed to take supplies to Brownsville. She started, with the supplies, nurses, and assistant surgeons, in charge of Surgeon Murray, of the

Marine-Hospital Service. On his arrival in Brownsville, he opened a hospital, took entire charge, furnished all the medicines, and treated all the sick that would apply or were sent there. He also had tents with him. Some cases of diphtheria and other diseases were treated. My recollection is, that about four thousand prescriptions were issued from our dispensary to the poor, treated by other physicians. Night and day those men worked to accomplish what they did and to save life. In about fifteen days, for it was not practicable to do it sooner, a shorter cordon line was established, extending from Santa Maria, on the Rio Grande, to the mouth of the Arroyo Colorado, at the Gulf. After that had been established, as we deemed, a sufficient length of time to demonstrate that no yellow fever was outside of the line, we intended and endeavored to discontinue, as my orders will show, the outer line. But in the meantime the epidemic spread on the Mexican side of the river. It extended from Matamoras to Reynosa, Camargo, Mier, Guerrero, and other places. One of those cities at least has a population of some twenty thousand. We were obliged to seize the small boats on the river, and to exercise an arbitrary authority; which, however, was sustained by the Governor of the State of Texas. These are the reasons why the Texas service was necessarily expensive. It could not be otherwise. You must recollect that it took almost an army of men to do this. The pay of guards was \$3 per day each. They furnished a mule, and subsisted the mule and themselves on that pay, and I don't think it excessive. They had no place to sleep except on the ground, with the saddle for a pillow and the blanket for cover. I wish to pay a tribute to those cow-boys, most of whom were employed on the outer line, if I never speak another word. There are no better men for that kind of duty in the world. They knew every cow-path and crossing in that region. So much for the measures taken. It has been charged that those measures were not successful. Here is the statement of the Governor of Texas. I ought to say that the original of this letter is now on file at the Executive Mansion in Washington:

EXECUTIVE OFFICE,  
Austin, Tex., October 17, 1882.

SIR: Your communication of the 11th instant, requesting a written opinion from me on the efficacy of the cordon thrown around Brownsville by the marine-hospital authorities, has been received, and it affords me great pleasure to submit the following in answer:

The immediate effect of the cordon was to allay excitement along the border counties. Other quarantine lines were drawn by the county and State beyond the cordon referred to; but as infection never reached these reserve guards, it is conclusive evidence that the marine cordon was not broken.

The few cases of yellow-fever occurring on ranches adjacent to Brownsville, and within the circle of guards, would force the inference that the poison would have reached the interior but for the quarantine.

All things considered, the effort made to protect the State from a general epidemic was a perfect success, and the people of Texas gratefully appreciate the intelligent and prompt assistance rendered by the marine-hospital authorities.

Very respectfully,

O. M. ROBERTS, *Governor*.

To Hon. J. M. TARBLE, *Mayor of Pensacola*.

The State health officer reports as follows, in his last annual report to the Governor. He is describing the epidemic. They denied that yellow-fever was there, as usual. He went there to investigate the matter, and was quarantined, and finally escaped through the intervention of the Governor.

"In the mean time, in response to an application from your excellency, Dr. John B. Hamilton, Surgeon-General of United States Marine-Hospital Service, in whose hands had been committed the contingent fund of one hundred thousand dollars appropriated by Congress 'to be used, in case of a threatened or actual epidemic, in aid of State and local boards, to prevent and suppress the spread of the same,' ordered Robert D. Murray, surgeon Marine-Hospital Service, to Brownsville, with instructions to confer with the State authorities in all measures to be taken for the suppression of the epidemic.

"Dr. C. R. Combs, and later on Doctor Wolff, was authorized to represent the State in the conferences referred to, and directed to co-operate with the Marine-Hospital Service in all their efforts to invest the fever district and confine the infection to its narrow boundaries. A double line of guards were stationed, one along the Arroyo Colorado, a stream encircling Brownsville on the east and north, and about thirty miles distant, and the other, organized and controlled by Dr. Arthur E. Spohn, acting assistant surgeon Marine-Hospital Service, reached along the railway between Corpus Christi and Laredo.

"The expenses of these extensive lines were necessarily great. September 30, the Marine-Hospital Service had paid out twenty-six thousand eight hundred and fifty dollars, and the expenses, all told, up to the date that quarantine was raised must have aggregated sixty-five or seventy thousand dollars.

"Our own expenses were greatly in excess of any previous year, the deficiency being about twenty thousand dollars. A river front of five hundred miles to guard, with crossings anywhere and everywhere, required a little army to make it efficient. The good accomplished, however, cannot be estimated by dollars and cents. The fact that the epidemic was confined to one place in Texas, while it desolated ranches and towns for hundreds of miles up the Rio Grande on the Mexican side, is strong evidence that the money was not squandered uselessly.

"For the fortunate results attained, the State is greatly indebted to the valuable assistance given by the Marine-Hospital Service."

Doctor Swearingen is in error about the amount. That was his estimate. In point of fact, it cost a trifle over \$49,000, including all expenses.



It was charged in Brownsville, by a man named Carson, that these guards were appointed for political purposes; that they were inefficient; that they belonged to a class of people known as "floaters;" that they were very bad men; and that the work did not amount to anything. Who is Carson? He stands practically alone among all the people of Texas in denouncing the quarantine. He stands alone among all the men who were treated by the surgeons of this Service who went there to relieve his sufferings, who attended, as I am informed, members of his own family. He stands alone in his infamy in attempting to denounce the men who saved his family from death. Having made these charges, I propose to say who he is. He is the agent of the Stillman Land Company, and the manager of the ferry that runs from Matamoras to Brownsville. This ferry was several times suspended by Doctor Murray and the State health officers, and was all the time under surveillance. I am informed that he never owned a dollar's worth of property in Brownsville, except a joint ownership in a stock opera-house. I don't say anything about his getting drunk; that may be somewhat indigenous to the soil. From the number of misstatements in his letter, I should think he was drunk. Mr. Carson seemed to have a doubt about the matter after he had written these charges, and here is a paragraph of a letter which he wrote to Doctor Towsey, one of Doctor Murray's assistants, who had written him for an explanation of his strange conduct:

OFFICE OF THOMAS CARSON, MAYOR,  
*Brownsville, Tex., March 22, 1883.*

MY DEAR DOCTOR: I enclose you a slip from local paper, with further statements about the Marine-Hospital Service, which may interest you to read.

The National Board of Health, in whose interest the statements are published, will expire, by law, on June 2 next, and not likely to be revived.

\* \* \* \* \*

Yours, truly,

THOMAS CARSON.

To Dr. SAMUEL A. TOWSEY,  
*Galveston, Tex.*

Mr. Goodrich, the deputy collector, stated to me that Mr. Carson showed him a letter from Major Smart. If he didn't write it, I ask him, (Doctor Smart.) who is here present, to answer. [A pause.] He don't answer! He admits it! This letter was to Carson about this business. Doctor Smart was not concerned about anything but finding out wherein this Service had been unsuccessful. He did not want to know how many people had been relieved, but rather to know how many had *not* been relieved. If there was a flaw, he wanted to find the flaw. These are

“scientific” methods; this was “gentlemanly”(?) conduct. I state to this committee that is the way public services ought *not* to be conducted, rather than the way it ought to be conducted. So much for those charges.

I will say here the charges were published in the Sanitary Engineer and The Sanitarian, of New York. They were sent broadcast throughout the country in all the papers that the National Board of Health could induce to republish them. They were, among others, as I am informed, offered to Mr. Preston, of the New York Herald, by Doctor Smart. Mr. Preston declined to publish those statements.

Major SMART. I never saw Preston.

Surgeon-General HAMILTON. Very well, I leave you and Mr. Preston to settle it.

These Carson charges were sent to the members of the Appropriations Committee of the last House. I was never called on to answer them, but I felt it was due to the Service I represented that the truth should come out. If the officers sent to Texas had been guilty of malfeasance, I wanted to know it. I had as much interest in finding out the truth of any such charges as the National Board of Health possibly could have, although impelled by different motives. I had the good of the Service at heart. I set an investigation on foot to find out what there was in it, and I will show you:

WASHINGTON, D. C., *March 27, 1883.*

SIR: Referring to article published in The Sanitarian of March 8, 1883, relative to the cordon for the suppression of yellow-fever established on the Lower Rio Grande, Texas, and which said article is composed of certain questions propounded by the mayor of Pensacola, Fla., to Thomas Carson, mayor of Brownsville, Tex., and his answer to same, I have this to say, that in the appointment of quarantine guards, Mayor Carson, in answer No. 9, states that they were politically known as “floaters” in politics; that they were named by (me) the deputy collector of customs, &c. On the 24th of August, the date of appointment of the first guards, I was compelled to close the custom-house, (all the officers being sick or nursing their sick families,) in order to find the necessary guards to make the river cordon effective, as directed by telegrams of the honorable Secretary of the Treasury; there was no intent or desire on my part to appoint none but Republicans, as Mayor Carson’s answer would imply, and I called upon Mayor Carson to assist me in finding men familiar with the country to be guarded and otherwise competent. Mayor Carson *named his own clerk* and several others, and until the present moment of writing I have not known how many were Republicans of the twenty or more appointed on that day. I discovered, on examining the list, that but three of these guards were known as Republicans, or, to my knowledge, have ever attended any political gathering of that faith, while a majority were well-known political and prominent members of Carson’s Democratic Club, known as the “Blue Party.” The guards appointed subsequently were selected principally from parties living on or near the

cordon line, and not one selected on political grounds. An Ochiltree striker, as the deputy collector is called, was not aware that they voted for or against Colonel Ochiltree.

Referring to my letter to the Department of September 23, 1882, submitting the names of the first guards appointed by me, I annex a list of their names and occupations:

Names.	Occupations.
Wm. H. Putegnat.....	Ex-Confederate soldier, and brother of principal druggist.
O. B. Walton, jr.....	Principal of the public schools of city of Brownsville.
W. O. Reichel.....	School-teacher.
Wm. More.....	Carpenter and builder.
Wm. Wilson.....	Hack-driver, and former merchant.
F. M. Campbell.....	Clerk district court, Cameron county.
T. B. Russell.....	Formerly inspector of customs.
Peter Collins.....	Clerk.
Joseph Webb.....	City treasurer, and Carson's clerk.
John McGovern.....	Merchant, ex-inspector of customs.
E. Baltizar.....	Carpenter.
Jules Lucadon.....	Deputy clerk district court Cameron county.
Martin Hanson.....	Builder and stock-raiser.
James O'Connor.....	Constable.
H. Schreiber.....	Barber, and formerly in Navy.
M. Werbiskie.....	Stock-raiser.
James Dougherty.....	Printer.
Christian Stein.....	Clerk, formerly adjutant-general Confederate Army.
Ferdinand Siebert.....	Deputy tax-assessor.
Charles F. Tilghman.....	Deputy clerk United States court, and United States commissioner.
D. M. Brown.....	Merchant.
H. Sherwood.....	Railroad agent.
J. I. P. Franklin.....	Formerly justice of the peace.
Charles F. Durr.....	Formerly constable.
Miguel Solis.....	Stock-raiser.

Having given this statement, it is not necessary to refute Carson's assertion that the guards knew nothing of the topography of the country, for the contrary is known to be the fact by the occupation of the majority of the persons employed, who not only are not the low class of people Carson represents them, but of the very best people of that section. In the absence of the necessary data, I am unable at present to give names and occupation of the other guards. That any of them were appointed by me for other than quarantine duty is false, and the fact of the disease not having passed out of the cordon is evidence of the efficiency of the appointees.

Mayor Carson's personal fling at Doctor Murray is certainly an ungrateful act, after Murray rendering a member of his family such service, after being given up by family physician, as no doubt preserved his life. There were ample medicines and all needed supplies furnished by the Marine-Hospital Service, and the personal services of Doctor

Murray in attending the sick, rich or poor, of the city, as well as the services of his assistants, if not appreciated by Mr. Carson, are appreciated by the entire community, whom they so promptly assisted in the late epidemic.

I am, sir, very respectfully,

E. H. GOODRICH.

*Special Deputy Collector of Customs.*

Hon. J. B. HAMILTON,

*Surgeon-General M.-H. S., Washington, D. C.*

I will not take up time by going into detail. Here is another document from Brownsville:

BROWNSVILLE, TEX., *April 30, 1883.*

Whereas representations have been made by interested parties reflecting against the character and value of the service rendered to the sick and dying of this county (Cameron) and the people of the State of Texas by the United States Marine-Hospital Service, as controlled by Surgeon R. D. Murray, under the advice and assistance of Deputy Collector Goodrich and Health Officers Combe and Wolff:

We, the citizens of Brownsville and Cameron county, deem it proper to state:

First. That we are acquainted with the reply of Thomas Carson to the questions of the mayor of Pensacola, and we hereby declare the same to be untrue or misleading, and, so far as it in any way reflects upon the duties performed, is unwarranted by a single fact.

Second. That we know the assistance rendered the sick in this city, at Point Isabel, at Santa Maria, and in the ranches in the quarantine district was prompt, liberal, and efficient, and that it resulted in saving many lives and preventing a panic, the consequences of which would have been serious.

Third. That Doctor Murray was untiring in his zeal to aid the suffering, risking his health, enduring great discomfort and privation, spending his own means without regard to his personal welfare or hope of reward, and that the imputation of ingratitude is added to the misfortunes our people have suffered.

Fourth. That Doctor Murray and the Marine-Hospital Service deserve the gratitude of the entire people of Texas, and the former should be held in especial regard and receive substantial proof of the good esteem in which he is held.

Names.	Occupations.
E. H. Goodrich.....	Deputy collector of customs.
F. E. Starck.....	Deputy collector of customs.
Wm. F. Demmett.....	Deputy collector of customs.
B. O. Hicks .....	Late member of relief committee.
Wm. Douglass.....	Clerk.
E. J. Kenedy.....	Storekeeper and weigher, gauger, and measurer.
Wm. E. Wilson.....	Inspector of customs.
N. G. Lane .....	Inspector of customs.
Chas. F. Tilghman.....	Deputy clerk United States circuit and district courts.

R. Storms .....	Inspector of customs and ward visitor, second ward.
James Dougherty .....	Ex-mayor of Brownsville.
John McGovern.....	Merchant.
M. Werbiski.....	Ranchman.
Jesse Dennett.....	Clerk.
Peter Collins.....	Carpenter.
D. M. Brown .....	Merchant.
H. M. Field.....	Contractor.
George Hill.....	
A. Merleiotz.....	Merchant.
George Champion.....	Ranchman.
Manuel Flores .....	Merchant.
Matt. Gerhard .....	Merchant.
Aaron Turk .....	Merchant.
S. Ashheim.....	Merchant.
Domingo G. Otero .....	
Geo. H. Watson.....	
Felix Alluns.....	
Theodore Marks.....	Merchant.
Louis Wise .....	Broker.
Geo. Wm. Miller.....	Mounted inspector of customs.
Jno. Jay Smith .....	Late captain United States volunteers.
H. Sherwood.....	Clerk.
H. Schreiber.....	Barber.
D. Wolf.....	Merchant.
G. Wash. Miller.....	United States customs inspector.
Wm. H. Putegnat.....	Carpenter.
J. M. Main.....	Physician.
W. D. Wilson .....	
George Wilmur.....	Merchant.
Howard L. Ross.....	Teacher in public schools.
Blas Olvera.....	Ranchman.
Hilario Fressino .....	Ranchman.
Christian Stein.....	Clerk.
John M. Haynes .....	Deputy United States marshal.
E. A. Mills.....	Deputy collector of customs.
Fimoteo Solias.....	Ranchman.
Crisostomio Longoria .....	Ranchman.
F. M. Campbell.....	Late clerk circuit court.
F. More.....	
F. Champion .....	
Geo. More.....	
P. Corlez .....	
Albert Nicholls .....	Teacher in public schools.
Facundo Cortez.....	
Teclo Cortez.....	
Sostenos Longoria.....	
Aniceto Guzman .....	
A. A. Marks.....	Merchant.
Nestor Marks .....	Merchant.
Victor M. Bueno.....	

That is signed by the leading citizens in Brownsville.



Here is a letter from Col. F. W. Latham, a member of the Legislature.

Mr. BEACH suggested that the contents be stated in order to save time; which was done.

The following is an extract of the letter referred to:

AUSTIN, *April 15, 1883.*

DEAR SIR: \* \* \* I can safely certify to your constant travel through the country, in the most intense heat of our summer, on horse-back, and that you administered to the sick, in many instances going out of your way to prescribe for them at my request, furnishing medicines as well. Since your departure, several persons to whom you prescribed medicine have expressed their gratefulness that I was the means of their obtaining relief by carrying you to them.

Hoping that this information will prove satisfactory, I remain your obedient servant,

F. W. LATHAM.

Doctor MURRAY.

The Surgeon-General then presented testimonials from Governor Roberts, Hon. A. J. Leo, health officer of Cameron county, statement of citizens of Hidalgo county, statements of citizens of Rio Grande City, Doctor Towsey's reply to Carson, Acting Assistant Surgeon Burk's reply to Carson, Acting Assistant Surgeon Finney's letter, and Surgeon Murray's letter.

Here are the testimonials and letters referred to:

THE FARM, NEAR AUSTIN, TEX., *May 30, 1883.*

DEAR SIR: I regret to have delayed writing an answer to your letter, from sickness and other causes.

As Governor of Texas, my attention was continually directed to your efforts and labors in confining the yellow-fever to Brownsville, in Texas, and in aiding the sick at that place during last year, and I then considered your services well directed and most valuable to the people of Texas in that arduous and disagreeable work. I am not aware of how it could have been done with more firmness and intelligence, and I am sure Doctor Swearingen, the State health physician, fully concurs with me in opinion on that subject.

Respectfully, yours, &c.,

O. M. ROBERTS.

Dr. R. D. MURRAY.

*Surgeon M.-H. S., Memphis, Tenn.*

HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES.

*Hidalgo, Hidalgo County, Tex., April 28, 1883.*

DEAR SIR: \* \* \* I can certainly say with all candor that your duty was discharged manfully and fearlessly; that the people of this county appreciate your services; that it is my candid opinion that the

marine and State guards, by their watchfulness and diligence, kept the yellow-fever out of this county and from spreading to other ports of this State.

Yours, truly,

A. J. LEO.

Dr. R. D. MURRAY,  
*Surgeon M.-H. S., Memphis, Tenn.*

BROWNSVILLE, TEX., *June 13, 1883.*

DEAR DOCTOR: By what I have read or heard, the mean attacks they have not spared to you have not hurt you in the least. I am glad of it, as for one I say that your services here were invaluable. I will always remember your kindness and attention at my bed, and my family will not soon forget the debt of gratitude they owe you.

Yours, affectionately,

ET. MELOU,  
*Health Officer, Cameron Co., and City Physician, Brownsville.*  
Doctor MURRAY, *Pensacola, Fla.*

HIDALGO, HIDALGO COUNTY, TEX., *May 1, 1883.*

We, the undersigned, citizens of Hidalgo county, Texas, having learned through the press of the country that Dr. R. D. Murray, surgeon in the United States Marine-Hospital Service, has been assailed for the discharge of his duty on the Rio Grande during our late yellow-fever epidemic,

In justice to Doctor Murray, we respectfully represent that he performed his duty faithfully, manfully, and fearlessly, and by his constant vigilance and diligence, with his cordon, with the assistance of the State guards, kept the yellow-fever out of this county and from spreading elsewhere, while the epidemic was raging with great force from Matamoras to Mier, on the left bank of the Rio Grande, a distance of over one hundred and fifty miles, and that not one solitary case of yellow fever has been known outside of Cameron county, where the city of Brownsville is situated.

Names.

Occupations.

C. W. Wilson.....	Deputy collector of customs.
Max Stein.....	Merchant of Hidalgo, Tex.
J. M. Franz.....	Inspector of customs.
Albert Dean.....	Inspector of customs.
F. O. Rauch.....	United States commissioner and merchant, Hidalgo, Tex.
M. Dominguez.....	
W. J. Odell.....	Postmaster, Hidalgo, Tex.
Wm. P. Dougherty.....	Inspector hides and animals, Hidalgo county, Texas.
B. F. Kidder.....	Clerk court, Hidalgo county, Texas.
Benton Lathrop.....	Physician.
P. A. Campbell.....	Teacher of public schools.
Thaddeus M. Rhodes....	County judge.
James L. Dougherty....	Sheriff and tax collector, Hidalgo county, Texas.

RIO GRANDE CITY, STARR COUNTY, TEXAS,  
*April 24, 1883.*

In view of the fact that we have read several newspaper articles, published at Brownsville, Cameron county, Texas, in which the arduous work of Dr. R. D. Murray, United States Marine-Hospital Service, is severely commented upon, we feel called upon at this late date to give an expression of our views in reference to the late quarantine established on the Rio Grande river, so far as it relates to Starr county.

With a river frontage of one hundred and fifty miles or over, with numerous crossing places, easy of access, to guard; with Camargo and Mier and numerous large ranches on the river bank thoroughly infected with yellow-fever, from which perhaps two thousand persons died, we owe our safety to the unremitting vigilance of the quarantine guards. That they were well organized and effectual in the discharge of their duties is due entirely to Surgeon R. D. Murray and his assistant in this county, Dr. W. C. Fisher. To their careful attention we owe the safety of our lives and that of our families.

We would be remiss in our obligations did we fail to acknowledge our indebtedness to the United States authorities at Washington in affording us timely assistance financially, as well as in the selection of Doctor Murray, to whom, through knowledge of our wants, we are so deeply indebted.

Names.	Occupations.
Sand J. Stewart.....	Deputy collector.
George W. Davis.....	Sheriff Starr county.
Emilio Vizcaya.....	Comerciante.
William Richards .....	Stock-raiser.
Horatio L. King.....	Lawyer.
Andrew P. Stevens.....	Justice of the peace, precinct No. 1.
E. Downey Davis.....	Clerk district court, Starr county.
James I. Vilx .....	Postmaster.
O. W. Burverton.....	District surveyor.
Carclampio Morales.....	Farmer.
Geo. Decker .....	County treasurer, Starr county.
Anartario Pexales.....	Deputy sheriff.
John P. Kelsey.....	County judge, Starr county.
E. Marks .....	Clerk Starr county.
James Clarke .....	County commissioner.
Ramon Gonzales.....	County commissioner.
D. W. V. Kennedy.....	County commissioner.
R. M. West.....	Clerk.
John Fries.....	Physician.
Emilio Decker .....	Comerciante.
Felisiano Acosta.....	Clerk.
Bernardo Rivera.....	Clerk.
Ferd. Costa .....	
John Vale, of Roma....	Deputy collector.
F. Rivadulla .....	Merchant.
J. Preciado .....	Merchant.
Pablo Garcia.....	Clerk.
L. Reinegas.....	Comerciante.
P. Marulie.....	Ex-sheriff.
José de la Paz Garza....	Creador.



Vos Cellao .....	Merchant.
W. Downs .....	Farmer.
Mammel M. Gutieva .....	Liquor-dealer.
J. R. Mourde.....	Attorney-at-law.
A. V. Kimmon.....	Clerk.
Lonis Lacarhe.....	Merchant.
Felix Morales.....	Clerk.
F. A. Davis.....	Hide and animal inspector, (deputy.)
Manuel A. Gonzales.....	Creador.
S. de la Pena.....	Drnggist.
Angustin de la Pina.....	Assessor of taxes of Starr county.
A. F. Mernverther.....	Carpenter.
Guillamo B. Garzas.....	Comerciante.
Keyes Lopez .....	Inspector of customs.
Luis Graquinz.....	Creador.
José Vircayo.....	Comerciante.
Ysidoro Pena.....	Comerciante.
Rafael Martinez .....	Merchant.
George W. Lowe.....	Inspector of customs.
Yldefonsa Canoka .....	Merchant.
Manuel Guillen.....	Sastre.
C. B. Hastings .....	
M. Gnerra .....	Merchant.
Lunano Minaz .....	Inspector of customs.
Wm. Jones .....	Physician.
Fomas Saenes .....	Stock-raiser.
Rafael Saens .....	Stock-raiser.
Brigido Palacios.....	Stock-raiser.
Carlos Phillips .....	Stock-raiser.
Joseph Barthelow.....	Inspector of customs.

—

GALVESTON, *March 27, 1883.*

MY DEAR DOCTOR: \* \* \* The object of these interrogatories can only be made to undermine and slander the good deeds done by the Marine-Hospital Service in this State, and more particularly in the yellow-fever district last summer and fall. A full sense of justice and honor compels me to give testimony, so far as I know, in support of a cause so righteous as a defence of any charges that may be trumped up against the Marine-Hospital Service.

Answer to 1st interrogatory: Governor Roberts, Governor of Texas, was the person to whom United States assistance was tendered, and so accepted by him, under the directions of Doctor ———, Texas State health officer, and to acknowledge by him, the Governor.

Ans. to 2d int.: This wassome time after the disease had been declared epidemic at Brownsville, and some ten or fifteen days after the Governor had accepted the proffered aid of the Marine-Hospital Service. This delay doubtless was caused by the State health officer's visit to the Rio Grande for observation and examination of the character of the prevailing disease there, consequently some three or four weeks before the cordon was established.

Ans. to 3d int.: By the decision of the Governor of Texas, Surgeon Murray, Marine-Hospital Service, together with Doctor Swearingen, State health officer, was given full and absolute control of quarantine

matters, and all the authority the State had was evoked by him to sustain them in their joint acts.

Ans. to 4th int.: Not directly, but indirectly, through establishing a hospital, the Marine-Hospital Service took charge of the hospital on Monday, the 28th of August, and closed it about the 2d of October. I was present at the hospital on the morning of August 28. The place was not only in a bad condition, but much worse as regards the medical authority of the same. The medical chief officer, Doctor Wolff, admitted two patients the morning of the 28th, after diagnosing each case, saying this is a fair specimen of the epidemic, but not admitting they were cases of yellow fever, which, to any intelligent medical man of yellow-fever experience, was wrong, as both cases were yellow fever, and both died of that disease, after throwing up black-vomit, on the fifth day.

Ans. to 5th int.: On Tuesday, the 29th of August, I was sent to Point Isabel by Doctor Murray, and on my arrival there at noon I found some eight or ten cases of yellow fever. Doctor Murray gave me a full supply of medicine and disinfectants before leaving Brownsville. These I obtained from his medical stores, taken by us on the revenue-cutter from Galveston and stored in the United States custom-house, including lemons, champagne, brandy, quinine, cinchonidia—in fact, all such remedies as generally are in use during yellow fever; and my demands on him for medical stores after this were always supplied immediately.

Ans. to 6th int.: I cannot answer.

Ans. to 7th int.: I do not know.

Ans. to 8th int.: I do not know of my own knowledge.

Ans. to 9th int.: (a) I do not know. (b) No.

Ans. to 10th int.: I received my pay as an acting assistant surgeon Marine-Hospital Service by draft from the United States Treasury.

Ans. to 11th int.: (a) No. (b) Never heard such a thing mentioned.

Ans. to 12th int.: Being at Point Isabel, had no opportunity of knowing.

Ans. to 13th int.: No, not entirely; the outside cordon was continued some time after the Cordon Arroyo was in force. This cordon superseded the necessity of the outside cordon.

Ans. to 14th int.: It was as near and complete a protection as the hand of man could perfect a cordon.

Ans. to 15th int.: Yes.

Ans. to 16th int.: Yellow fever is never stamped out, but dies for want of material, as in this case. The disease had exhausted its life within the cordon, had nothing left to sustain itself.

Ans. to 17th int.: I believe the cordon was productive of much good, and prevented a more extended epidemic along the entire Rio Grande country east.

Very truly, yours,

SAMUEL A. TOWSEY, M. D.

Surgeon R. D. MURRAY, *Memphis, Tenn.*

GALVESTON, *March 24, 1883.*

DEAR DOCTOR: \* \* \* I am clearly of the opinion that efforts have been and are being made to disparage the work done by the Marine-Hospital Service in the infected district of last fall, and a sense of justice impels me to give what testimony I can to support the righteous claims of the Marine-Hospital Service.

Answer to No. 1: Tender of assistance was made to the Governor of the State of Texas, and after acceptance the assistance was sent.

Ans. to No. 2: About one month after the disease had been declared epidemic, and about two weeks after the Governor had accepted the aid offered by the Marine-Hospital Service.

Ans. to No. 3: According to the decision of the Governor of the State, Surgeon Murray and the deputy State health officer had absolute control of quarantine matters, and all the authority of the State was invoked by him to sustain them.

Ans. to No. 4: Not directly, but indirectly, through the establishment of the hospital. I wish to say here a few words: The Marine-Hospital Service took charge of the hospital August 28, and closed it on the 2d of October. The hospital at the time of transfer was not in very good odor, and this was not altogether overcome by retaining part of the former administration. After the imported male nurses had proved inefficient, they were discharged from ward duties and their places supplied by native (Mexican) nurses. No efforts were spared by the medical officers of the Marine-Hospital Service to induce the poorer classes to send their sick friends there, and in this they were measurably successful, notwithstanding the ignorant prejudices of the Mexicans against hospitals in general and the organized action of interested parties against this one in particular. The amount of relief furnished in the hospital and dispensary will be shown by the records now in possession of Surgeon Murray. I may state that the out-door records are incomplete, owing to hurry and pressure of business.

Ans. to No. 5: Do not know.

Ans. to No. 6: Do not know.

Ans. to No. 7: Yes.

Ans. to No. 8: No.

Ans. to No. 9: (a) Do not know. (b) No.

Ans. to No. 10: In the absence of Surgeon Murray, by the collector of the port. After receipted pay-rolls approved by Surgeon Murray have been forwarded to Washington and audited, the disbursing clerk of the United States Treasury makes out the drafts on the assistant treasury at New Orleans, payable to the claimant or order.

Ans. to No. 11: (a) No. (b) None.

Ans. to No. 12: I presume the Corpus Christi and Arroyo Colorado cordons are referred to. No disease occurred outside of the Arroyo cordon, to my knowledge.

Ans. to No. 13: Not entirely; for the outside cordon was continued for some time after the establishment of the Arroyo cordon, but it certainly removed the necessity for such outside cordon.

Ans. to No. 14: That it was as efficient as human wisdom could make it.

Ans. to No. 15: Yes.

Ans. to No. 16: The fever was not stamped out, but exhausted the available material inside the Arroyo cordon, and then ceased.

Ans. to No. 17: It would have been further extended, and, as it would have reached successively persons less and less acclimated, its effects would have been more severe, (compared with death-rate in Brownsville and in Pensacola.)

I am, yours truly,

J. E. BURK, M. D.

R. D. MURRAY, M. D., *Memphis, Tenn.*

MEMPHIS, TENN., *March 21, 1883.*

DEAR SIR: \* \* \* In justice to yourself, to your assistants, and to the Marine-Hospital Service, in which you have the honor to head a commission, I think it but proper that you should take some active steps to correct the slanderous reports circulated at the instigation of the mayor of Brownsville. I am confident that any person gifted with common intelligence, on glancing at Mr. Carson's articles, would be able to detect that the author was either unacquainted with the facts, or has allowed his blind prejudice to lead him into statements which he knows will not gain the sanction or approval of his more rational townsmen.

I am astonished to find that, of the many you have so nobly assisted whilst in Brownsville, there could be found one so ready to play the Judas, and especially that one a person indebted to your skill for the preservation of his relation's life; and when we consider his base ingratitude, I think it is almost unnecessary to pronounce his answers false in toto.

Mr. Carson is laboring under an erroneous impression in regard to his inventory of the drugs and supplies brought by you from Galveston, and he would find some trouble in getting his statement corroborated by the officers of the "McLain" and the drug-house of Thompson & Olmsted, Galveston. Certainly he did not observe the cincho. pills, cincho. in bulk, bromide of quinia, morphia sulph., iodide of potass., elix. gentian, elix. calisaya bark, and other drugs too numerous to mention.

It is evident that his hotel was situated some distance from the hospital, or else he would have diluted his answer, and not the carbolic acid. On close inspection, he would have discovered that there were a few more of champagne, that the lemons were more abundant, the mustard more profuse and of a better quality, and last, but not least, he would have witnessed the development of "the four boxes of other wines and brandy" into two barrels of port and catawba wine and an abundant supply of brandy. But he is excusable, for doubtless his vision is as limited as his ideas.

In regard to the drunkenness and disturbances created by your Galveston nurses, and to the discharge of the nurses found in the hospital on your arrival, that is a falsehood of "the purest ray serene," and worthy of the source from which it came. Not a nurse was discharged, but, in fact, several additional ones were employed from time to time, as the occasion demanded.

As Mr. Carson appears so anxious about the welfare of his Mexican neighbors, I will here state that, without an exception, they were all Mexicans. Instead of the fourteen patients said to occupy the hospital on our arrival, we succeeded in finding nineteen; but doubtless the five extra ones we were fortunate enough to discover took advantage of the large dimensions to hide whenever their awe-inspiring mayor appeared. There is also a slight mistake about the twenty-four patients Mr. Carson generously allowed the hospital, for, to my actual knowledge, we had at one time thirty-three under treatment. If the popularity of the hospital was growing when we arrived, it certainly continued to increase, as shown by the above signs. Though this is not great, still it is sufficient to prove the truth of the facts by Mr. Carson to the relief committee on the morning after our arrival. That morning (August



28) he informed the committee that the hospital patients had not received the proper medical attention.

On investigation, it will be discovered that the local physicians did not lighten Doctor Wolff's hospital duties; neither did the relief committee; neither did the honorable mayor.

To supply your deficiency of drugs, Mr. Carson nobly allows three hundred bottles of charcoal, when the order was only for six dozen. But, for fear his liberality might get the better of his required end, he ignores the water of ammonia and other chemicals used in the ice factory, besides the drugs carried gratis to Messrs. Putegnat & Braner.

Another tangible evidence of marine aid is the four thousand prescriptions filled at the hospital, the three hundred consultations, and the wards provided for by yourself and aids; also, the lemons, drugs, and disinfectants dispensed, not only to the city, but to the surrounding country.

Mr. Carson is excusable for his mistakes in regard to the hospital, for his time was so fully occupied by his political duties that he never entered the hospital from the time we took possession to the day it was closed.

Again, we arrived in Brownsville on the 27th of August, and the cordon was organized on the 29th, though probably Brownsville's almanacs, like Brownsville's politics, differ from the rest of the United States.

In regard to your being antagonistic to the local health authorities, that is something of a paradox, as you constituted the local health authority, and on the most pleasant terms with the State health officer. It may be that Mr. Carson imagines that the local health authority is included in the supreme sway of the mayor.

Provisions, medicines, and medical aid were furnished all parties quarantined, and, as Mr. Carson's friends discovered to their cost, there was not only possibility but a strong probability of meeting a stray guard or so in attempting to cross the cordon. Besides, he makes a mistake of about one hundred in his estimate of the number quarantined.

The mayor is correct when he says the disease spread among the ranches, and was seldom fatal, but he neglected to add that its mildness was principally due to the prompt attention of the Marine-Hospital Service. Doubtless that insignificant fact escaped his memory whilst engaged in the pleasant task of "handling the Marine Service without gloves." Another omission of the mayor's is, that the "floaters" who constituted the cordon consisted of the more influential men of the town, and that there were but two Republicans amongst them, and that fact was not discovered until the cordon was disbanded. Again, these two Republicans did not vote the Republican ticket in any field except that vast field, Mr. Carson's imagination.

Furthermore, you issued an order prohibiting all canvassing on the cordon, and personally requested all candidates for public offices to resign. I regret to see that the mayor is so badly informed in the political affairs of his own State as to take the genial Tom Ochiltree for a Republican, and not an Independent of the deepest dye.

As to the tenth question, I am not ———, but, judging from his preceding answers, I would not believe Mr. Carson on general principles. The only money used for political purposes, that I could discover, was that fund over which Carson presided as chairman of the relief committee. I was myself stationed near a cordon post, but failed to see any

Republican canvassers pass the guards. "Genial Tom" also failed to see his Democratic ballot-box distributor pass through the lines. Mr. Carson *does* understand the twelfth question, and, if he desired, could answer that the disease *did not* spread beyond the cordon, and was confined strictly within its limits. Another forcible factor which our mutual friend failed to discover is, that the establishment of a cordon not only lessened the quarantine expense of Texas, but saved the State from the ravages of the plague.

The efficiency of the cordon and the men who composed it can readily be seen when we remember the fate of Camargo, Mier, and other towns on the Mexican side. The exempting the rest of Texas displays the wisdom of the movement, and proves that the money was better employed than it would have been in the hands of that close observer, Carson, and his political nag. Without the cordon the fever might not have been more severe, but it undoubtedly would have been more general, though I am sorry that my views conflict with those of that eminent scientist, Thomas Carson, mayor of Brownsville.

In future, when the mayor wishes to criticise the movements of his superiors, let him post himself, and at least sprinkle truth more liberally with his fiction; and if *gratitude* will not win his respect, then let him have *some* regard for the *truth*.

FITZHUGH FINNEY.

Dr. R. D. MURRAY, *Memphis, Tenn.*

#### UNITED STATES MARINE-HOSPITAL SERVICE.

*District of the Mississippi, Surgeon's Office,  
Memphis, Tenn., March 8, 1883.*

SIR: My attention is called to a correspondence published in the Sanitary Engineer of March 1, 1883, between J. M. Tarble, mayor of Pensacola, Fla., and Thomas Carson, mayor of Brownsville, Tex., relative to the work done in and around Brownsville by the Marine-Hospital Service during the prevalence of yellow fever at Brownsville and in Mexico during the past summer and autumn. I do not reply for the purpose of lauding the Marine-Hospital Service or gaining increased credit for myself, but only to rebut a modicum of the maliciousness, ingratitude, and duplicity of Carson, who, in his entire effort, has scarcely told a single truth, and if one, his friends will give him the credit of not meaning it.

It is difficult to answer all of Carson's falsehoods without keeping in mind the questions of Mr. Tarble, and *vice versa*. I will therefore strive to answer Tarble first, noting Carson's jokes under the same number. Interested parties will do well to read the effusion of the honorable Thomas in connection with this.

*Mayor Tarble's questions to Mayor Carson, and Surgeon Murray's answers to the same.*

1. Was any tender of assistance made to your city by the Marine-Hospital Service other than by the establishment of a cordon?

Answer: Yes. I offered to care for all who were ill of yellow fever, and, if the hospital was filled, to rent every house in town, if necessary, until sufficient beds were provided, but I declined to formally declare "every house a hospital ward." I also tendered medicines to all the

sick from the hospital dispensary, and the services of my assistants in house-to-house visitations. Carson could not know what I took to Brownsville. Among the supplies were three large Army hospital-tents, twenty-four cots, 10,000 pills sulphate cinchonidia, 160 ounces same in bulk, (about one-half of the latter is still in Brownsville,) some hydro-bromate of quinine, and a tierce of excellent mustard, all of which was used. The wholesale drug-house that sold me the carbolic acid will be puzzled over the "diluted" until they know it was diluted by Carson to disinfect the town. The supplies taken were ample to supplement the local stock on hand, portions of which were purchased as occasion required. The hospital was taken charge of August 28, and closed October 2. The corps of nurses was retained without exception. The nurses procured in Galveston were procured on Carson's very asperse telegram to Doctor Kelley, president Galveston board of health, and were as good as nurses generally are. They were not a lot of drunken rowdies, and did no act or acts to alarm the Mexican people; in fact, they performed their duties to the best of their abilities, which is much more than can be said of Carson. At most, the hospital and the tents would have accommodated sixty patients. Carson is pardonable for saying that the "building was capable of accommodating two hundred sick," for he was never in it. He is also warranted in speaking with definiteness as to the number of sick in the town, as it is well known that he did not waste his time in visiting sick people, as did the customs officers, but he rather treasured his strength for those terrible contests with Murray "Pasha." The hospital increased in public estimation after Doctors Finney and Burk took charge of it, as will be inferred from what Carson says, despite his flat denial of the fact. Carson's appeal for relief sent to the Governor of Texas was sent out before I reached Brownsville. The moneyed response of the people of Texas did enable the relief committee to relieve distress, and it also enabled much credit to be taken by Carson's club for charity, &c., which was used in the local election canvass, and will be used again when the election for mayor comes around.

2. How long was it after the declaration of the epidemic before the cordon was completed?

Ans. Yellow fever existed in Brownsville and Matamoras early in July. The ferry (T. Carson, manager) was closed July 29. The disease was considered epidemic in Brownsville August 7. River guards were put on, under joint management of Goodrich, deputy collector of customs, and Carson, August 24. The Marine-Hospital Service relief party arrived August 27. The Arroyo cordon was placed around Brownsville during the night of August 29. No one was consulted in regard to it, for reasons obvious to any one who has ever been in a plague-stricken town.

3. Did the officials of the Marine-Hospital Service work in any way antagonistic to or in opposition to the local boards of health?

Ans. No. The mayor of Brownsville assumed control of the Rio Grande, but the Governor of Texas helped him out of his difficulty. The mayor was afraid that the paupers from Mexico would eat up the charity funds, but the manager of the ferry hankered after the numerous *reals* that were being lost by the closure of the ferry. I, in co-operation with the local health authority, opened the ferry on September 11, but T. Carson, manager, violated the stipulation made by himself to keep out the paupers. As Carson's duplicity was placing



myself and the local health authority in bad faith with the Governor of Tamaulipas, with whom we had an agreement, on the 12th of September the State health officer and I closed the ferry we had opened the day before. To eliminate the thirty or more paupers let in by Carson required the issuance of passes for a few days. We simply returned to the condition existing from July 29 as regards the ferry. About the 19th of September, Carson succeeded in getting sufficient misapprehension in the minds of the Mexican population on which to organize a mob, which, rushing through the streets, shouting "Death to Murray," overawed the customs officer on duty at the ferry, and opened it. The next customs officer on duty was arrested by Carson's order, and put in jail. For two days the ferry was open, but not free, and the mayor of Brownsville was quarrelling with the Governor of Texas. The ferry was again closed by the State health officer and myself, to be reopened by us when we thought fit. As the relief committee ceased to issue provision-tickets at this time, no further care as to the mayor's fears of paupers was necessary. The charge that I proposed to call for United States soldiers is a base lie, as Carson knows, for he was a party to the badinage from which the story sprung. I was driven from no position, except that I was not permitted to use as much of the United States appropriation as I wished to. I went out to the cordon on September 25, and remained till October 1, to see in person that the travel-restricting measures were properly conducted. The professional demands upon me up to that date precluded my departure, and the overflow of the river rendered the journey practically impossible.

4. Was pecuniary aid given by the Government in any way, save in connection with the cordon?

Ans. Yes; the services of myself and three excellent physicians. We treated seven hundred and fifty cases of yellow fever outside of hospital. We furnished over four thousand prescriptions from the hospital dispensary, September 1 to October 31. Over one hundred and fifty cases were treated by myself alone, for which I furnished all the medicines. All the expenses of the hospital were borne, including hack-hire and burial. Large supplies of medicines were sent to ranches and given to river guards to dispose of as need should arise. Proffer of aid to fumigate houses was made but declined. Sanitary inspectors, one for each of the four wards, were paid for the month of September. Disinfecting material, sulphate of iron, (ten barrels,) sulphur, (four barrels,) carbolic acid, (two barrels,) and carbolic soap, (one barrel,) was supplied.

5. What was the nature of the aid given to refugees within the cordon lines? State, please, if provisions, medicines, and attention were given them.

Ans. No aid but medicines and attention was provided for refugees. Shelter existed at all but two posts, and tents were sent to those.

6. Please state, as near as possible, the number of people who were removed from the city through the efforts of the authorities; also what disposition was made of them.

Ans. No people were removed or detained by the restrictions. The purpose was to restrict travel and to permit people to be free as possible, considering the interests of the greater number outside of the cordon. Hundreds of persons stood the allotted quarantine and passed out. The six men referred to by Carson were one white man, who, by his advice, went into Mexico and eluded the guard on his return. Car-



son told him at which place to cross. The unfortunate man was caught and kept in quarantine by the man whom Carson had suggested as being vulnerable. The other five were negroes—Tampico Railroad men—who applied for aid. Carson told them how to slip past the cordon. They were apprehended by my own scouting party, kept in quarantine ten days, fed by the guards all the time, and sent out perfectly free from contagion, but not having a healthy opinion of T. Carson. It was impossible to get out of the cordon except under conditions that cannot be guarded against or that are not infectious.

8. Was contagion carried to any other cities by such refugees as were released from the cordon quarantine?

Ans. No. Persons released from the cordon were not only healthy, but clean. Fever was carried to the cordon, but never beyond it.

9. Who were appointed as cordon guards and officials; Democrats or Republicans? Do you think politics effected such choice and appointments?

Ans. (1) Good men, who would do the work without fear or favor. (2) No. The August 24 river guards were chosen by Carson and Goodrich, (deputy collector of customs,) to whom the word "floater" applies as well as it does to Carson himself.

10. By what officers was the money for the disbursement of cordon distributed?

Ans. Disbursing clerks of the Treasury Department. United States officers at Brownsville could not violate laws made in other countries by clandestinely sending mail—pay-rolls—out by way of Monterey, Mexico.

11. Was there any suspicion that the funds were used for political ends; if so, what evidence of it?

Ans. No. There was no Republican ticket. No canvassers of any sort passed the cordon without ten days' detention and proper cleansing. The funds were only used for the "suppression of an actual epidemic."

12. Did the disease spread within the two lines of cordon in the camps to any extent?

Ans. Disease was stopped by the Arroyo cordon. Some cases probably passed the line before the guards were stationed.

13. Did the establishment of the cordon remove the expense of quarantine against Brownville by other cities, or did it reduce such expense?

Ans. There are no cities in Texas within one hundred miles of Brownsville. Expenses in adjacent counties greatly reduced, and if confidence in the methods of the Marine-Hospital Service had been gained sooner, all expenses would have ceased.

14. What is your opinion of the efficacy of the cordon?

Ans. It kept the fever very nearly within the limit of August 29, and prevented its progress into a thickly-populated part of the county. The cordon guards knew every road, horse-path, cow-path, crossing, and inhabitant. No one crossed the cordon either with or without Carson's promptings, if in a condition to carry infection.

15. Do you think that its establishment was wise?

Ans. Yes. The cordon on the Arroyo cost but little, and as an experiment has repaid the country.

16. Do you think that the effects of the cordon had anything to do with stamping out the fever?

Ans. Yes. The disease could not pass the Arroyo Colorado, a stream from one hundred to two hundred feet in width, so long as honest

guards held all the possible crossings. It did spread to all the free-intercourse ranches within the lines. It is well to bear in mind that Carson has never had any opportunity, and if he had, has little ability, to judge of the relative or practical value of anything which does not bring money to the said Carson.

17. Do you think that without the cordon and its influence the plague of yellow fever would have been any more severe?

Ans. Yes; the devastation would have been terrible. The influence of the cordon brought peace and healing to Brownsville and the district within the Arroyo, and aided in preventing the fever from passing into Texas along a river distance of two hundred miles. On the south side it passed from Matamoras to Mier, over two hundred miles, increasing in fatality as it progressed. The Arroyo cordon checked it at St. Maria, forty miles or so west of Brownsville. The upper river guards, State and marine hospital, working in unison, kept it from crossing the Rio Grande.

*Politics and elections.*—The advice and assistance of Deputy Collector of Customs Goodrich was invaluable, and without the hearty aid of the customs officers at Point Isabel, on the Gulf, to Roma, two hundred miles by road up the river, I would have failed in my mission; but in all our councils politics had no part or place. I was always anxious to remove the Arroyo guards before election day, November 7, but the continued existence of fever and absence of "northerners" prevented. The last death occurred on the 6th November. There being no other cases, the order to come in was sent out on November 9, and at sundown November 10 the cordon was disbanded. No guard reached the town until the 11th. But one guard was a candidate for office. All were citizens, and had a right to seek office, and when the fact of candidacy was known to me, they were discharged at once. The cordon separated voting precincts, but did not divide them. The charge of interference with the elections is utterly baseless, as every citizen on the Arroyo knows.

Had Thomas Carson been on the alert in June, or had some one else been manager of the Matamoras ferry, I would not have the task of writing this, nor would Carson need to be grateful to me for saving a number of his family. If I am charged with arbitrary acts, that should be put down as chief.

In conclusion, the Marine-Hospital Service was not ungenerous, not unkind, not arbitrary, or useless. The people of Brownsville are grateful, the people of Texas are grateful, and I am conscious of having aided in a noble, difficult, and wonderful work.

R. D. MURRAY,

*Surgeon Marine-Hospital Service.*

Surgeon-General J. B. HAMILTON,

*United States Marine-Hospital Service,*

*Washington, D. C.*

I have said sufficient and produced sufficient evidence, I presume, to convince any reasonable man of the utter falsity of the charges that the quarantine was badly managed.

In regard to cordons, if the committee desire, I can explain from a sanitary point of view why an inland quarantine was established, and for what purpose. I deem it, however, scarcely pertinent to this occa-

sion to do so; but I will say that in the Russian plague which appeared in the winter of 1878 an International Sanitary Conference was called, at which council Professors Hirseh, Besiadetsky, Cabiadis, Petrisco, and Eichwald, gentlemen equally eminent for their knowledge of epidemic diseases, recommended the establishment of the *cordon sanitaire* as a means of preventing the further spread of plague. That was carried out practically by the Cossacks. The priests and physicians who went there to relieve the sick died of the disease. It was marked with great fatality, and to prevent further spread of the disease this international conference was called. All the countries in Europe took action against the spread of the plague.

We took some action. There was a law on the statute-books of the country known as the National Quarantine Act of April 29, 1878, a portion of which is still unrepealed. No money was appropriated to carry out that law, but the Secretary of the Treasury could take action by giving orders to collectors of customs to prevent the introduction of infectious goods, notably rags from Egypt suspected of plague infection. That order was faithfully carried out. In the spring, the Russian cordons having been successful and the plague stamped out, the rag order was rescinded, since which time it has not been promulgated until last summer, when, through the danger of the importation of cholera, it was practically revived.

Now let us take up the National Board of Health management of the Pensacola epidemic of 1882, with which, I am told, unfavorable comparison was made. There was at that time a gentleman in Pensacola known as Tarble, collector of the port, at that time mayor of the city. I am not altogether sure, and would not like to say positively whether he was collector when the epidemic first appeared, but he was shortly afterwards—at any rate he was mayor of the city. He issued a proclamation August 11, 1882, as follows:

MAYOR'S OFFICE, PENSACOLA, *August 11, 1882.*

Whereas it has come to my knowledge that vessels arriving at the quarantine station from infected ports have during the past year, after an ordinary observation, been permitted to come to the city and take cargo; and

Whereas the recent case of the Spanish bark "Saleta" is a notable instance of the inefficiency of our present quarantine:

Now, therefore, I, J. M. Tarble, mayor of the city of Pensacola, do hereby notify all vessels sailing from or touching at any Mexican, South American, West Indian, or other infected ports, which may arrive here on or before the 15th day of October next, that they shall not be permitted to hold any intercourse or communication whatever with the city, unless the quarantine permit shall be countersigned by the city physician and mayor.

J. M. TARBLE, *Mayor.*

In response to this, the local board of health, on August 13, 1882, issued a series of preambles denouncing the mayor and his action. This is a copy of the resolutions. I will not take up time by reading them, except three paragraphs:

"The board of health denounces in unmeasured terms the proclamation of the said J. M. Tarble, as being knowingly and maliciously false and gratuitously injurious to the city of Pensacola.

"*Be it further resolved*, That this board pledges itself to protect all masters of vessels and others from the meddlesome, unauthorized, and illegal interference of said Tarble with quarantine matters, as indicated in his proclamation.

"*Be it further resolved*, That this board stands ready to substantiate the absolute truth of the above resolutions, and is ready and willing to have a public investigation of its books, papers, records, &c., to show conclusively that the statements of the said J. M. Tarble, on which his proclamation is based, are false in each and every particular."

This board of health was a *protégé* of the National Board of Health. This local board of health called Pensacola a healthy city at the very time when the greatest epidemic that has ever appeared there was starting. They called it healthy from August 10; until the first case was announced by Dr. R. C. White, an acting assistant surgeon of the Marine-Hospital Service, after he saw it in the marine hospital. They called it a healthy city up to the 30th of August. I propose to say that the people of Pensacola believe that the responsibility for the introduction of that great epidemic of yellow fever in Pensacola directly rests on the board of health.

The CHAIRMAN. Which board?

Surgeon-General HAMILTON. Both boards, the local and the national, the local directly; indirectly, the National Board of Health.

"Upon the unqualified recommendation of Doctor Bemis, of New Orleans, member of the National Board, a quarantine physician was appointed and sent to the station. Every confidence was reposed in the ability of the board to keep out the disease, and it relied implicitly upon the quarantine physician sent from New Orleans, Dr. Carrington. But the latter part of August it passed the quarantine and made its appearance in the city."—(Historical sketch of Pensacola, page 93.)

This feeling was universally indulged in by the citizens of the town. It was also indulged in officially. The grand jury of Escambia county made an official presentment against the board as being directly responsible, through their maladministration of local quarantine, for the introduction of yellow fever.

Now, Mayor Tarble stated to me that he thought the money that had been sent to Pensacola during this epidemic by the National Board of Health had been improperly expended. I asked him to say so officially, in order that I might know the fact, because I presumed at some



day they would lay claim to the extreme value of their services in Pensacola, and, judging from the past, I thought it might be well to have the facts. I have a letter from Mayor Tarble as follows:

WASHINGTON, D. C., *February 6, 1883.*

DEAR SIR: Your letter of inquiry, under date of the 5th instant, is received.

To your first inquiry, relative to the amount received and expended in Pensacola during the late yellow-fever epidemic, I will say that report there estimates the amount at \$75,000. This, I think, is over-estimated, and, in my judgment, about \$50,000 were received and expended during the epidemic. I think about \$45,000 were expended by the board of health.

(I ought to say, in explanation, that they were at the time asking contributions from the people of the United States.)

To your second inquiry, whether any State funds were received and expended after the epidemic ceased, I have to state that I know of no State fund having been expended. I was informed by the Secretary of the State board of health that they received from the National Board of Health about \$11,000, and after the close of the epidemic they applied to the National Board for more funds, and received \$2,000. This latter amount was divided up amongst the doctors, giving each from \$400 to \$500. This was given them in excess of the fee of \$50 which they uniformly charged every yellow-fever patient.

To the inquiry as to what means were taken by the surrounding towns to prevent the spread of the epidemic, I will say that the navy-yard, Millview, Ferry Pass, Milton, and Bagdad, and all the towns on the line of the Louisville and Nashville Railroad, from Pensacola to the junction, a distance of forty-four miles, kept up a strict quarantine, requiring guards night and day, at a great expense to each town.

I was collector of the port and the mayor of the city of Pensacola, and in the latter capacity became the custodian of the funds sent me for the poor and destitute. These funds were separate and distinct from any fund received by the board of health.

J. M. TARBLE.

Surgeon-General JOHN B. HAMILTON,

*Marine-Hospital Service.*

I would further state that upon my return from Washington, on the 15th of September, I called on the board of health members and tendered them the aid of the Treasury Department for the purpose of protecting the surrounding country from the spread of the yellow fever. This offer was positively refused by the board of health, they alleging that they were obtaining all the funds they needed from private subscriptions and from the National Board of Health, and they would not accept the offer of the Department.

J. M. TARBLE.

I desire the committee to especially note the reasons stated by Mr. Tarble why the yellow-fever did not spread beyond Pensacola. There is further corroborative evidence of this in letters from physicians which are published in the last annual report of this Service, notably by Doctor Anderson to Doctor White.

*Doctor Anderson to Doctor White.*

MILLVIEW, FLA., *January 17, 1883.*

DEAR DOCTOR: In regard to inquiries of yours relative to the escape of this town from an epidemic of yellow fever while it was raging in your city, I would say that, as soon as it was known here that "the fever" had broken out in Pensacola, or about the 28th day of August, 1882, the citizens called a meeting for the purpose of devising a plan for preventing the introduction of it into this town, and telegraphed the Governor of this State at once, requesting the appointment of a full board of health. \* \* \*

At the meeting so hastily summoned, it was at once decided to put guards on all the public roads, whether leading from Pensacola or elsewhere; and they were accordingly stationed, with full instructions to allow neither ingress nor egress. To keep the "cordon" thoroughly established, and in accordance with instructions from the board of health, which had by this time received commissions from his excellency the Governor, there were ordered four stations, which required the regular payment and maintenance of eight guards per day. For a month of the time that the epidemic prevailed in Pensacola, an additional station was thought to be necessary, and was accordingly ordered by the board of health, but afterwards discontinued, as its necessity was not manifest.

These guards were employed at the rate of \$1.25 per day, and the total amount paid them for services, from the beginning to ending of epidemic in Pensacola, very closely approximated \$1,000.

The quarantine restrictions were most rigidly enforced, no person being allowed to enter the quarantine limits of the town, no freight being allowed to come from Pensacola, and the mail being submitted to close and persistent fumigation. In fact, the strictest non-intercourse was established and maintained, and only to this fact do I attribute our somewhat remarkable escape. It is true that the burden of quarantine fell upon a few; but what is that to the number of lives saved and the business interests being kept intact? Its weight is indeed light.

As president of the board of health, I had every opportunity of watching closely the health of the town, and, as I anticipated from its location, found the malarial diseases very prevalent, especially in the form of malarial remittent fever, but had the great satisfaction of effecting a protection to yellow-fever encroachments, a *rigid quarantine*. This, I am convinced, is our only safeguard in such epidemics.

I am, dear doctor, very truly, yours.

WARREN E. ANDERSON, M. D.

Dr. R. C. WHITE, *Pensacola.*

This appropriation in aid of local boards of health is, in its nature, a corruption fund, nothing more. It means, whenever a board of health applies for money, that board of health gets the money. They are bound to indorse the hand that feeds them. They cannot help it. That is one of the conditions. If that is the policy of this Government, a disbursing clerk is all that is necessary to carry out the objects of such an appropriation. If I must draw a check, if a check must be drawn by anybody in favor of a local board of health for so much

money, Mr. Kelly could just as well draw the check, as to have, from time to time, eleven dignitaries to authorize him to draw it.

Mr. Waring's imputation that I do not understand sanitary matters, in his speech at last meeting, is due perhaps to the fact that he is not familiar with the early history of this Board. I have here a letter of the National Board of Health, in which they asked my opinion on quarantine :

NATIONAL BOARD OF HEALTH,  
*Washington, D. C., May 29, 1879.*

SIR: The executive committee of the National Board of Health directs me to inform you that a full meeting of the Board will be held on Tuesday, June 3, 1879, and to state that, in case the bill recently passed by Congress is signed by the President and becomes a law, the executive committee and the National Board of Health desire to consult with you, and obtain your views as to the execution of the law.

The desire of the Board is to obtain the results of the experience which the Marine-Hospital Service has gained in the execution of the former law, to receive such suggestions as to the course to be taken, as you may give, to examine the blanks and forms now in use, and to obtain such aid, counsel, and assistance as you may be disposed to furnish the Board.

I am, doctor, very respectfully,

THOMAS J. TURNER,  
*Secretary National Board of Health.*

Dr. J. B. HAMILTON,  
*Supervising Surgeon-General M.-H. S., Washington, D. C.*

The CHAIRMAN. Were you ever a member of this Board?

Surgeon-General HAMILTON. Never. An officer of the Service is detailed.

I propose to tell you what Mr. Waring probably did not know, that the first regulations of this Board under the act to prevent the introduction of contagious diseases were submitted to the President of the United States, and by the Secretary of the Treasury to me for opinion. I gave an opinion criticising their regulations, showing that they were so loosely drawn they would not answer the purpose. I have the letter here. Inasmuch as it is important, I ask to read it.

I ought to give you the history of this letter. On carrying the regulations as criticised to Secretary Sherman, and expressing my objections, he said: "This ought to go to the President; you write a letter, and I will sign it." I wrote the letter. In place of signing it, he sent it to the President, who sent for me. He said: "I do not like to veto the National Board of Health; that would be dignifying that body more than perhaps I ought to; but I will send you to that Board, and you can explain to them the objections to the issuing of the regulations in their present form." I must say, Mr. Chairman, that was rather an

onerous duty to put upon me; but I obeyed orders. I read this very letter to that Board. Before doing so I requested the Secretary to give me some written authority, and he gave me the following letter to present in person:

JUNE 25, 1879.

SIR: By direction of the President, I transmit herewith the rules and regulations proposed to be adopted by your Board "for securing the best sanitary condition of vessels, including their cargoes, passengers, and crews, coming into the United States," for such corrections as you may have to make upon revision. When corrected, you are requested to return them to me for transmission to the President, or to send them directly to him, as you may prefer.

Very respectfully,

JOHN SHERMAN.

*Secretary.*

Dr. J. L. CABELL,

*President National Board of Health, Washington, D. C.*

—  
TREASURY DEPARTMENT,

*Washington, June 16, 1879.*

To the PRESIDENT:

I have the honor to return the communication of Dr. J. L. Cabell, president of the National Board of Health, with accompanying "Rules and regulations for securing the best sanitary condition of vessels coming into the United States from foreign ports where any contagious or infectious diseases exist," and to recommend that the rules and regulations be returned to the National Board of Health for revision, for the following reasons, namely:

First. In explanation 3, the definition given of an infected port can scarcely be correct, as either cholera, yellow fever, plague, small-pox, or typhus may "exist" sporadically, without necessarily infecting the whole place. This is recognized in the latter part of the paragraph, which says: "Or at which either small-pox or typhus fever exists as an epidemic." As the contagious principle of small-pox is certainly as active to non-protected persons as that of either of the other diseases, this paragraph might state that when any or all these diseases exist as an epidemic, then the port to be considered as infected.

Second. Explanation 4 is defective, in that it fails to state by whom the "points" should be observed. Paragraph B of this explanation lacks directness. Paragraph C should give directions in regard to the method of ventilation.

Third. Rule 1, line 3, as it stands, is in conflict with explanation 3, in regard to the existence of infectious or contagious disease, as the rule includes all such diseases, while the explanation excepts small-pox and typhus fever. Lines 17 to 19 are open to the same objection, as are also lines 4 and 5, on page 4. Either the "rule" or the "explanation" should be changed.

Fourth. Rule 3, page 4, is defective, as no officer or person is designated whose duty it shall be to make the required indorsement.

Fifth. In rule 8, last sentence, consuls are not instructed as to the kind of certificate to be given, should decayed wood be found, whether



the vessel is to be detained until the wood is replaced with sound material, or whether he is to content himself with simply noting the fact on the certificate.

Sixth. Rule 10 is impracticable, inasmuch as it is impossible for any one to know whether any article is infected. Suspected articles or goods from a known infected region might easily be excluded.

Seventh. Rule 12 is incomplete, as, while it was probably intended that the consular authority shall state on revision "whatever changes have taken place" in the sanitary condition of the vessel, cargo, passengers, officers, or crew, it fails to specify the kind of changes that should be noted.

Eighth. Rule 13 is couched in such language as to be unintelligible. Reference is here made to the sentence "and when the sanitary or other local authority of the port declares such existence," which refers to nothing in this rule except by implication, as nothing had been before said to exist. The phrase "when such cessation is established" is crude, to say the least.

Ninth. Rule 15 is also defective, (see lines 8 to 11,) in that it fails to state whether the report called for is to be made to the health officer of the home port or of the foreign port.

Tenth. Rule 16 is also defective, inasmuch as it fails to specify the means necessary to prevent articles which are thrown overboard from floating.

Eleventh. Rule 17 is impracticable, as neither the captain, owner, nor agent may be able "to furnish all required information." If this rule were modified so as to mean that such persons should reply, under oath, to all questions to the best of their knowledge, then the rule might be carried out. As the clause stands it amounts to an irksome restriction on commerce. Furthermore, the clause in regard to foreign vessels, while probably intended to refer to such only as are bound for some port of the United States, does not so refer.

Twelfth. Rule 18 is impracticable, as no exception is made of seamen on watch, and it is apparently presupposed that all hands suspend labor at once, and before nightfall. The rule, if adopted, would work a hardship to the men, as they are required to perform laundry-work, and to bathe daily, without regard to the climate or season. It is not clear why a rule of this character should be enforced on the crew of a ship any more than upon the officers or passengers. This rule might, with advantage, be condensed so as to leave only the last two words of line 8, lines 9, 10, 11, 12, and 13, the first two words of line 14, and the last two words of line 17 to the end of the paragraph. It would then read: "The crew shall not be allowed liberty on shore after nightfall in suspected localities. They shall not be allowed to sleep on deck, except under awnings. The forecastle shall be well ventilated and kept dry. Both in port and at sea, the bilge shall be pumped out each morning or evening, or more frequently, if necessary. The utmost cleanliness shall be observed at sea, as well as in port."

Thirteenth. Rule 20 defeats itself, for it directs that evidence shall be presented to the foreign health officer instead of to the health officer at the United States port of entry, and furthermore fails to specify what shall constitute the evidence required.

There are many general objections which apply to nearly all these rules, one of which is, that the sanitary requirements are not made obligatory on the officers of the vessels, who are not, technically speaking,

considered as the crew, consequently the responsibility is not fixed; another is, that the blank form for bills of health fails to show the port from which the vessel last sailed, an important point in the sanitary history of the vessel thus being omitted.

The possible breach of international comity, in requiring United States consuls to inspect foreign vessels in a foreign port, is a matter worthy of consideration before these or any similar regulations shall be adopted.

The regulations should have a copy attached of the section of the act by authority of which they are framed.

I now present the letter of the board accepting the corrections.

The CHAIRMAN. You wish to show you were consulted?

Surgeon-General HAMILTON. No.

The CHAIRMAN. That you were considered an expert?

Surgeon-General HAMILTON. I mean to say that those regulations drawn by the National Board of Health were loosely drawn; that they were disapproved by the President of the United States when submitted to him; that they were submitted to me for revision, and to tell you that they accepted all but two suggestions; and they were finally obliged to add one of these to their regulations, viz: that consuls should refuse a manifest to vessels carrying goods "known to be infected." I made the point that goods could not be "known to be infected," and that those "suspected of being infected" should be substituted.

They also left out of their bill of health the sanitary condition of the place from which the vessel last came, one of the most important points to be stated in a bill of health.

NATIONAL BOARD OF HEALTH,  
*Washington, D. C., June 26, 1879.*

SIR: I have the honor to acknowledge the receipt of your communication of the 25th instant, transmitting, by direction of the President of the United States, the rules and regulations proposed to be adopted by this Board for securing the best sanitary condition of vessels, &c., coming into the United States, and to say that, in accordance with your suggestion, the Board has revised said rules and regulations, and now respectfully submits a corrected copy of the same.

Very respectfully, &c.,

J. L. CABELL,  
*President National Board of Health.*

Hon. JOHN SHERMAN,  
*Secretary of the Treasury.*

I should think their cheeks would tingle with shame to imply that I do not understand sanitary matters in the face of these facts. I cannot understand how gentlemen make such statements in the face of the record.

Then, too, Mr. Chairman, there was the sanitary convention. A law was passed by Congress, at the instigation of the National Board of

Health, to authorize the President to call an International Sanitary Conference. When it was called I was informed by the Secretary of the Treasury that the State Department had called upon him to send delegates to that convention, or rather to submit suggestions to that conference. I wrote a letter in regard to that conference, which bears on this whole question, and inasmuch as it is so wide in its scope, I will read it. It will give you some idea of the position taken on this question, especially in regard to the States. It was written on the 17th of June, 1880:

TREASURY DEPARTMENT,  
*Office Supervising Surgeon-General U. S. M.-H. S.,*  
*Washington, June 17, 1880.*

SIR: I have the honor to acknowledge the receipt by reference of sundry papers in relation to a proposed International Sanitary Commission, together with a letter of the honorable the Secretary of State on the subject, enclosing a copy of his correspondence with the British minister and a memorandum in relation to points proposed to be submitted to an "International Quarantine Conference." The papers of the Board of Health in this case are apparently based upon the idea that the United States has power to bind the States, as the preamble and resolutions of the National Board of Health recommend the adoption of an international system of quarantine, as well as notification, but as since the documents were written the matter has been passed upon by Congress in the act approved May 14, 1880, no further action upon the resolutions would appear to be necessary. The act reads as follows:

"JOINT RESOLUTION authorizing the President of the United States to call an International Sanitary Conference, to meet at Washington, District of Columbia.

*"Resolved by the Senate and House of Representatives of the United States of America in Congress assembled.* That the President of the United States is hereby authorized to call an International Sanitary Conference, to meet at Washington, District of Columbia, to which the several powers having jurisdiction of ports likely to be infected with yellow fever or cholera shall be invited to send delegates properly authorized, for the purpose of securing an international system of notification as to the actual sanitary condition of ports and places under the jurisdiction of such powers and of vessels sailing therefrom."

Thus only a system of notification is provided for by the resolution. The resolution repeals no previous law or statute, and these clearly express that the authority of the States in the matter of quarantine is paramount.

Notwithstanding the fact that Congress has by law constituted an organization known as the National Board of Health, the act constituting it delegated no power, except that of giving advice.

The act of June 2, 1879, which was based on the Quarantine Act of April 29, 1878, gave the Board the additional authority of framing rules and regulations, subject to approval, for the prevention of the introduction of contagious diseases, empowered them to receive consular reports, and authorized the detail of medical officers, not to exceed six, to serve in the offices of United States consuls, from whom

information regarding the sanitary condition of those foreign countries where contagious diseases have in the past prevailed was expected to be obtained. This act repealed no previous enactment except such as related to the reception and publication of the information received from consular officers. In reference, therefore, to such of the remaining portions of the act of April 29, 1878, as remain unaffected by subsequent legislation, will show that section 5 of such act expressly provided "that there shall be no interference in any manner with any quarantine laws or regulations as they now exist or may hereafter be adopted by State laws." Section 4792 of the Revised Statutes, which has not been even constructively repealed, directs that all officers of the United States shall duly observe all quarantine and other restraints established by the health laws of any State, and directs the officers therein specified to act under the direction of the Secretary of the Treasury. Thus, as stated in the outset, the health laws of the States have been held to be paramount, and no officer of the United States has authority to act in contravention of any such law. The fact alleged by the National Board of Health of their inability to prevent unnecessary quarantine by the States, would appear to be well grounded, irrespective of the action of foreign powers. The limited power given the United States authorities by the act of June 2, 1879, to make seizure of vessels for failure to obtain a bill of health from a United States consul, has been nullified by the operations of section 3 of said act, which provided "that none of the penalties herein imposed shall attach to any vessel, or any owner or officer thereof, till the act and the rules and regulations made in pursuance thereof shall have been officially promulgated for at least ten days in the port from which the said vessel sailed." It was only necessary, therefore, to defeat the operations for the proper authorities of any given foreign port, to forbid the promulgation of the act, and the regulations based thereon, which has actually been done at Havana—by far the most prolific source of importation of yellow fever.

As no officer of the United States nor the National Board of Health has power to make any rule binding upon the States, it is equally clear that no sanitary conference could have other than a mere advisory power, subject to approval or rejection by the several States, and that any regulation could only be recommended; it could not be enforced. This, therefore, would render it advisable that each State should be represented in such sanitary conference; but such representative could not be legally empowered to act, except by the Legislature of the State; and, as under the Constitution the States are not treaty-making powers, the fact of such representative being so empowered could not carry with it binding force. It would seem, therefore, in every way preferable, if a treaty were negotiated with the several powers by the State Department. In such event, each government would doubtless receive the advice of its properly-constituted health authorities quite as freely and more direct than by the proposed International Sanitary Conference, provided such action is permitted by the Constitution and laws. This course, if adopted, would bring the negotiations through the regular and usual channels, there being no apparent reason why an exception should be made in a treaty in relation to the public health, in which commercial interests are involved, than would be made in case of a treaty negotiation involving any other technical matter; and, after all, the question of the details of quarantine is quite as much one of administration as of technical or theoretical knowledge.



I can conceive of no system of sanitary notification which could be carried into successful operation without the consent and co-operation of foreign countries, nor would such notification be likely to be carried out unless it were reciprocal. To be reciprocal would require legislative enactments by the several States. There is now no means of compelling any State or city in the United States to furnish to United States officers specific information regarding any epidemic or other disease. Such information, when given, is given voluntarily, and if chosen to be withheld, there is no means of obtaining it, except perhaps by the employment of special inspectors by the National Board of Health, which the laws creating that body evidently did not contemplate. But such inspectors could act as such only; they could perform no other official action. Therefore, should the International Sanitary Conference be called under existing laws, however desirable it may be to secure such a system of notification, the United States would be placed in the humiliating position of having called a conference to devise laws or regulations which they could have no constitutional right to enforce. In my opinion, before any profitable result could follow from an International Sanitary Conference, further legislation by Congress and the States is necessary. The States could doubtless compel any State officer therein to make such reports as might be necessary to complete the system of sanitary notification. Whether they think proper to make such enactments is scarcely worth while to discuss, although it is probable that the interest of those States likely to become infected would lie in the direction of such legislation. The enclosures are herewith returned.

I am, sir, very respectfully, your obedient servant,

JOHN B. HAMILTON,

*Surgeon-General M.-H. S.*

HON. SECRETARY OF THE TREASURY.

It resulted as predicted in that latter. They voted in convention what would be desirable to be done; but they could not do anything, and they went home. I do not say it was dishonest in the National Board of Health to ask Congress to do something which they could not do; I do say (if I may use their term) it was "injudicious."

Doctor CABELL. Mr. Chairman, will you allow me to make a single statement?

Surgeon-General HAMILTON. That is the gentleman to whom I referred, when speaking of the letter written to the Speaker.

Doctor CABELL. I am compelled to go home by duties that must be performed there this afternoon. I wish to state that, after the election of Mr. Carlisle, I stated to him that during the previous session it had been found almost impossible to get a meeting of the Committee on Public Health, and when the chairman called one we never got a quorum, at least when I was here. I was anxious the committee should be constituted by members who took an interest in the subject, and would he permit me to give him a list of names of gentlemen in regard to whom I had heard and in regard to others who felt an interest in



the public health—that they would hold meetings of the committee and hear all that was to be said. I gave him a list of twenty names—fifteen or twenty—stating that I did so to avoid any possible imputation of a desire to pack the committee, saying also that I was not personally acquainted with more than one or two, Doctor Davis, of Massachusetts, and Col. Casey Young. I had taken it for granted that Colonel Young would probably be appointed chairman, because he had been so in former years. He was the patron of the bill of June 2, 1879, that we wish to renew. Speaker Carlisle asked me to put the names in writing; that he had a good many applications of that sort made to him; that he wanted to consider them at his leisure. I did so. I never made any secret of it, and would do it again to-morrow. I disclaim any idea of packing the committee with persons known to be friendly. Doctor Davis can state whether I exacted any pledge from him. He is the only member of the committee of the names suggested.

Mr. DAVIS. I can state the circumstances under which it is possible my name was mentioned. I met Doctor Cabell, Doctor Johnson, and an elderly gentleman from New Orleans—

A VOICE. Doctor Bemiss.

Mr. DAVIS. Yes; Doctor Bemiss—at the Riggs House. It transpired in conversation that I had been a member of the State board of health of Massachusetts. The Doctor remarked: “You will be a proper person to put on the Public Health Committee; would you object to that?” I remarked: “I should object,” saying that I had been many years connected with those matters, and would like well enough to have a change of thought; that my constituents had very large interests of various kinds which required close attention, and I would prefer not to be a member of the committee. Said he: “If appointed, would you serve?” Said I: “I cannot say. Probably I should feel compelled to serve if appointed.”

Doctor CABELL. You mentioned the fact that you had been for several years a member of the State board of health of Massachusetts.

Mr. BEACH. From the time the Speaker was elected until several days after his assignment of these various committees, I never saw him or made any request of any kind whatever for an assignment to any position on any committee. All of these gentlemen now present—those representing the Marine-Hospital Service and the National Board of Health—are entire strangers to me, and I was entirely unaware that there was any conflict between these Services or bureaus. I was at home when I saw the announcement made in regard to the committees. I first saw it in the New York Herald, and was surprised that I had been assigned to the position.

Surgeon-General HAMILTON. Mr. Chairman, as long as this seems to have taken this wide range, I wish to disclaim saying that the committee was packed. I simply stated that the attempt had been made to pack the committee, and the statements now made before the committee show the matter in its proper light. They can draw their own conclusions.

Mr. BEACH. Any one acquainted with the high-toned character of the Speaker would not suppose he would make an attempt to influence committeemen. It is a well-known fact that whenever the attempt has been made it invariably failed. Where application was made for assignment a upon certain committee, almost in every instance he refused the application.

Surgeon-General HAMILTON. I never saw the letter, and my remark was made without the slightest reference to any gentleman of this committee.

[The committee then adjourned to meet Thursday, February 21, 1884.]

---

The committee held a meeting on Thursday, February 21, at which Surgeon-General HAMILTON said:

Mr. CHAIRMAN: In continuation of the discussion of the public health legislation of the past four years, and the executive acts that were had thereunder, it is pertinent now to refer to House Bill No. 4290, which was introduced into the last House at the instigation or request of the National Board of Health. That bill, as you will see on inspection, differs in some particulars from the bill at present before the committee. It had the franking privilege in it, which has been stricken out of this present bill, and some other matters in relation to quarantine, which have also been eliminated, but the general objections to that bill apply to the present bill under consideration. I desire to read a letter containing the objections against that bill, and as showing why the last Committee of Public Health failed to report the bill to the House, which was practically an adverse action taken in this committee—or rather the Public Health Committee of the last Congress—in relation to this same subject. I was asked by a member of that committee to give him my opinion on the bill, and I did so in the following letter:

MARCH 6, 1882.

Hon. W. S. ROSECRANS,

*Member Committee on Public Health—*

The CHAIRMAN interrupted by inquiring of Doctor HAMILTON if he would not state the contents, instead of reading the whole letter.

Surgeon-General HAMILTON. I then omit the principal part of my letter. Now, in regard to the latter part of this letter, wherein I stated the reasons why the quarantine should be placed under the control of the Treasury Department, and further stated that there was abundance of work for the National Board of Health to do outside of the quarantine proper, that there might be a large field in the nature of sanitary investigations—that there was such a field in which they could be profitably employed. I have now changed my opinion in regard to that matter, and to say that I do not now believe there exists such a field for their operations, for the reason that we now have a bureau, specially equipped by appropriation of Congress, for that very work—I mention the Museum of Hygiene, in the Navy Department. They have in that museum appliances for sanitary investigations, for the investigation of everything affecting public health. They have specimens of the sanitary machinery that is in use for the protection and preservation of the public health. That bureau, as I am informed, is fully equipped and ready for work, without any additional expense on the part of the Government. They have the officers now for the accomplishment of that work without employing any additional force.

The CHAIRMAN. Who has charge of that?

Surgeon-General HAMILTON. The Secretary of the Navy. I have now to speak of the so-called Mississippi river “inspection service.” That service was established by the National Board of Health some years ago, and, so far as I am able to judge, it has been of little service in the past, nor is it likely to be of much service in the future. The marine-hospital surgeons stationed along that river can inspect the boats whenever required, without expense. I stated to this committee at the previous meeting the worthless condition those vessels were in when turned over to me, and that the “fleet” would be useless, so far as maintaining quarantine was concerned, unless a quarantine were also maintained on land, which is apparently not contemplated by the bill under consideration. Here is an official letter in regard to those boats. It shows that they were badly managed, the stores on them were improperly kept, and that the packages were falling to pieces:

U. S. MARINE-HOSPITAL SERVICE, DISTRICT OF THE GULF,  
*Port of New Orleans, Surgeon's Office, August 7, 1883.*

GENERAL: I have the honor to invite your attention to the following facts in regard to the fleet of boats recently brought from Memphis. The sulphur is stored on the hull “Vasant.” Most of the barrels will fall to pieces when handled. The hull just mentioned I am afraid, from the report of the present superintendent, who has had much experience, will sink when the large steamers begin running. The hospital barges, having never been loaded, float so high that they are full

of seams above the water-line, and could not now be loaded until thoroughly calked. It would not be practicable to put all the stores aboard the "Benner." I could store them on the hospital grounds, but it would cost a large sum to do it, owing to the fact that a good portion of the batture is still under water. During a severe storm in July, several of the stanchions in the launch "Sentinel" were broken. If there is any prospect of using it, I should think it expedient to have them repaired. I have a complete inventory nearly ready, but find there has been little care taken for the preservation of articles. I have ordered a large number of things sent to the laundry, that would otherwise soon be ruined.

Very respectfully,

JOHN GODFREY,  
*Passed Assistant Surgeon.*

SURGEON-GENERAL MARINE-HOSPITAL SERVICE.

Now, there was a charge made, if I am correctly informed, that the Marine-Hospital Service was in favor of superseding the State authorities in regard to the management of the epidemic fund. In answer to that charge, it is only necessary to quote the circular of August 9, 1882, which is as follows:

*Circular—Threatened or actual epidemics.*

1882.  
Department No. 91. )  
Marine-Hospital Service. ) **TREASURY DEPARTMENT,**  
*Office Supervising Surgeon-General U. S. M.-H. S.,*  
*Washington, D. C., August 9, 1882.*

TO MEDICAL OFFICERS OF THE MARINE-HOSPITAL SERVICE  
AND OFFICERS OF STATE AND MUNICIPAL BOARDS OF HEALTH:

I am directed by the Secretary of the Treasury to inform you that Congress, at its last session, enacted that—

"The President of the United States is hereby authorized, in case of a threatened or actual epidemic, to use a sum not exceeding one hundred thousand dollars, out of any money in the Treasury not otherwise appropriated, in aid of State and local boards, or otherwise, in his discretion, in preventing and suppressing the spread of the same."

He further directs me to inform you that the President has decided to employ this contingent appropriation through the agency of the Treasury Department, and that, in case of a threatened or actual epidemic, immediate action will be taken, upon application from the Governor of a State addressed to the Secretary of the Treasury.

JOHN B. HAMILTON,  
*Supervising Surgeon-General U. S. M.-H. S.*

I can also show from the annual reports of this Service where I have been placed on record in regard to that matter:

"In conclusion, it is proper to say that, under existing law, the duty of the Government apparently ends with the maritime quarantine, and the question of local municipal sanitation is one which may not only with propriety be left to the States, but all existing law has heretofore done so, and that, however desirable it might be for the Government to undertake the work of general sanitation, it is evident that the limits of such a work could not be foreseen at the present time. So in-



timately is this question connected with the local police and municipal government, that interference by Federal authority is not only unwarranted, but probably mischievous."—(Ann. Report, 1883, p. 51.)

I undertake to say that, with the exception of the seaboard quarantines, not in a single case has any epidemic fund intrusted to the Treasury Department been used within a State except in pursuance of the request of the Governor of that State, and usually with a further statement on his part that the State was unable to maintain the necessary expenses on its own account.

I shall now speak of the work of last year.

Mr. DAVIS. You mean expenses relating to quarantine?

Surgeon-General HAMILTON. Yes, sir. Here is a brief statement of the dangers we were in last summer from the importation of contagious disease into this country. This paper was read before the Maryland Sanitary Convention, and is now published by the Maryland State board of health.

The CHAIRMAN. Doctor Wyman's?

Surgeon-General HAMILTON. Yes.

"Thus during the past season the situation has been briefly as follows: Cholera in China, Egypt, and Syria, seriously threatening an approach to our shores; yellow fever raging in Mexico, Central and South America, and in the West Indies, and actually knocking at the portals of New York, Philadelphia, Baltimore, Mobile, Pensacola, New Orleans, Galveston, and San Francisco, and, finally, a serious epidemic of yellow fever in the Pensacola naval reservation, probably originating there, and from thence threatening the interior. It would seem that the danger to the country has been greater than the immunity which we enjoyed permits us to realize."

So much for the dangers from the importation of epidemic disease; and I ask the indulgence of the committee for reading it, as it is more clearly stated than I could state it in an off-hand manner. The national quarantines were maintained last year in addition to the local quarantines at Pensacola, which quarantine was maintained on the personal and official request of Governor Bloxham, of Florida, and at every one of them yellow-fever vessels and patients were received and treated. These quarantines were located at Ship Island, Sapelo Sound, and Cape Charles.

Now as to the operations on land at Pensacola last summer. When the yellow fever broke out at the navy-yard, it was necessary to protect that city by precautions other than the maritime quarantine afforded. That was done by means of the *cordon sanitaire*. The president of the board of health of that city was known to me as an old soldier, a Prussian by birth, who had served several years in the Prussian army, and



later in the Confederate army. I knew he was energetic, faithful, and thoroughly competent to manage that line. For that reason I gave him charge and full control of the cordon line around the navy-yard. You will see the stations there in checks on the map. [Exhibiting map.] You will see—

MR. PETTIBONE. This was the line? [Indicating.]

Surgeon-General HAMILTON. Yes. You will see how carefully that reservation was invested; not a single case escaped that line. Two persons with alleged yellow fever were reported at Pensacola during the summer, and they were immediately removed to the quarantine station for treatment. They had not been at the navy-yard, nor at any vessel from the quarantine. Doctor Murray and his assistant at quarantine—Doctor Lennard—however, deny that these cases were suffering from yellow fever. Through some mistake, after the removal of the patients, the house itself was burned, a more thorough fumigation than was contemplated in the beginning. After the epidemic was over, the Escambia grand jury met and made their annual presentment to the circuit court, a copy of which I have. In their concluding paragraph they say:

“In conclusion, the grand jury congratulates the people in those sections of the country which were visited by the yellow fever last summer and fall that a concurrence of the board of health, the Sanitary Association of Pensacola, its municipal government, and the United States Marine-Hospital Service gives token that all that human ingenuity and prudence can do will be done to prevent a visitation of that scourge to this county the coming season.”

That is a very different document, Mr. Chairman, from what was presented the previous year, when the members of the local board of health were presented as neglecting their duty, and every man but one resigned in pursuance of the presentment to the grand jury.

Here are resolutions of the present board of health of Pensacola, giving their statement as to the efficiency of the work performed during last summer. I will not take up time by reading it, but will insert it in my argument:

*Be it resolved by the board of health of the city of Pensacola,* That this board wish hereby to express their perfect satisfaction with the conduct of the Marine-Hospital Service during the past season, in connection with this board, in the management of the marine and inland quarantine in this county.

*Be it further resolved,* That this board of health recommends that the authority of the said Service, under existing laws “for the prevention and suppression of epidemic diseases,” be continued; and the board respectfully urges the Senators and Representatives of this State in Congress and his excellency the Governor to give this Service all the

aid they can in maintaining its claims to the assistance of the Congress of the United States to carry out the objects indicated in these resolutions.

Adopted January 21, 1884.

JOHN B. GUTTMANN,  
*President.*  
GEO. B. LOUD, *Secretary.*

By Mr. Clubbs:

*Be it resolved*, That this board hereby expresses their appreciation of the services of the United States Marine-Hospital Service, under the direction of Surgeon-General J. B. Hamilton, in the conduct of our maritime and inland quarantine, and for the valuable aid rendered by that Service during the past season.

Unanimously adopted.

Extract from the minutes of the board of health, Pensacola, Fla., January 21, 1884.

[SEAL.]

GEO. B. LOUD, *Secretary.*

Now, Mr. Chairman, it has been charged that I have tried to "influence public opinion." I gave you reasons at your last meeting, and at the present, how public opinion was influenced in the matter. "All the witchcraft which I have used" is found in these circulars, these orders, and the acts of the officers who were appointed to carry them out, and that they have been successful. I admit that public opinion has been against this Board almost from the beginning. Congress has twice refused to entertain their plea for a continuance of appropriations. The President twice declined to expend the epidemic fund under their direction. In this action he was carrying out the expressed intention of Congress, for the proposition to amend the section of the appropriation act by requiring the expenditure of the money through the Board of Health instead of the President was defeated by a nearly two-to-one majority on the floor of the House. The State Department, too, seems to have been "influenced" against this Board, for the very first thing it did when the law expired by limitation in last June was to issue this circular. You will please observe it is dated on the very day of the expiration of the act:

*Circular.*

DEPARTMENT OF STATE,  
Washington, June 2, 1883.

GENTLEMEN: Inasmuch as the act to prevent the introduction of contagious diseases into the United States, approved June 22, 1879, expires by its own terms this day, you are hereby instructed to make all reports in future relative to sanitary matters directly to this Department.

I am, gentlemen, your obedient servant.

JOHN DAVIS,  
*Acting Secretary.*

To the CONSULAR OFFICERS OF THE UNITED STATES.

Mr. DAVIS. It was their duty to issue the circular when the law expired. They would have done so anyhow.

Surgeon-General HAMILTON. There is further evidence of the opinion of that Department in reference to that matter. I am informed there is a communication now before the committee. I believe a letter has been written by the State Department taking strong ground against that very section.

Mr. PETTIBONE. I understood that to be the fact; that the State Department desire to have the reports made through their own channels, direct to the head of the Department. I believe they are right in that, unless I can have some good reason to the contrary.

Surgeon-General HAMILTON. So far as this quarantine question is concerned, the Board of Health themselves are not unanimous. I have here a letter from Doctor Cabell, which was published in *The Sanitarian*, a journal published in New York, January 4, 1883, in which he states that "a national system of quarantine could make no distinction without violating an express provision of the Constitution." Then he said :

"To recapitulate, I hold that any attempt to supersede State authority in matters of quarantine, or for the General Government to exercise concurrent jurisdiction with the States in regard to quarantine, would be inexpedient."

So the president of the National Board of Health does not believe that he can even have concurrent jurisdiction with the States in regard to that matter. I have further evidence as to the lack of unanimity in the Board. Here is a letter from Dr. Stephen Smith, of New York. You all know who Dr. Stephen Smith is. There is not a man better known in sanitary matters in the United States than Doctor Smith. That gentleman is at present the vice-president of the National Board of Health. He was the first president, I believe, of the American Public Health Association, and it was largely through his efforts that that association was organized. That gentleman has expressed himself unequivocally that the quarantine service should be maintained by the Marine-Hospital Service. I will read you what he says. He goes on at some length to say that he deprecates any quarrel and any fighting between branches of the public service, (an opinion, I might say, in which I fully coincided then, and do now.) He wrote :

"Now, my dear doctor, the Board has no interests in quarantine which it will not cheerfully resign to you, and, if need be, aid you to obtain. Woodworth and I long entertained the opinion that the Marine-Hospital Service should be the head of the quarantine system of the United States, and I believe every member of the Board would cheerfully aid

to secure it to your Service. If, in addition, you desire to build up a central health department around the Marine-Hospital Service, there will be no opposition by the Board, and I should favor it. Finally, whatever may be your wishes, I wish to suggest that they can be better obtained by a free conference with the Board than by "fighting." I can assure you of the most cordial, friendly feeling on the part of the Board as a whole, and I do not believe that there would be any difference of opinion as to the policy which the two Services should jointly pursue.

"Very truly, yours,

"STEPHEN SMITH."

There spoke a noble soul; but he did not seem to know the composition of the Board.

The CHAIRMAN. What is the date of that letter?

Surgeon-General HAMILTON. August 16, 1882.

Now, Mr. President, as to the unwieldy character of the National Board of Health in time of emergency, I desire to refer to the Annual Report of the Marine-Hospital Service for the year 1882, in regard to the epidemic of small-pox on the Upper Missouri. Relative to that matter, the collector of customs at Fort Benton, on the 12th day of May, sent a telegram to the Secretary of the Treasury that the steamer "General Meade," plying on the Upper Missouri river, had small-pox on board. She was then at a landing known as the Coal Banks, about forty miles below Fort Benton. I took the telegram over to the then secretary of the National Board of Health, Doctor Turner. I asked him if they could take action. "Yes," he says, "we will take action, but will have to call a meeting of the Board. Doctor Cabell is in Virginia; he is on the executive committee. Doctor Smith is in New York. We will have to get the executive committee together." I said: "This won't do; something has got to be done at once." I then took the dispatch to the Secretary of the Treasury, and after consultation with him, the following dispatch was sent:

TREASURY DEPARTMENT,  
Washington, D. C., May 13, 1882.

Collector W. H. HUNT,

Benton, Montana, (via Bismarck:)

If you can get quarters on shore for small-pox sailors on board steamboats, do so. Employ physician, not exceeding \$10 per day, and remove patients from vessel. Municipal authorities must provide for persons not sailors. Vessels liable for expenses of fumigation.

HAMILTON,  
Surgeon-General.

He telegraphed that there were no local sanitary authorities. Then I telegraphed him to organize a committee and recognize them as local sanitary authorities, and let him be the executive officer of that com-



mittee; which he did. It was in a Territory; there were no State laws in force to interfere with any such action on the part of the Government. He got an acting assistant surgeon from the Army, and the business was done without any trouble and without any friction, and the cost of it was a bill for \$30, which was referred to the National Board for payment, they at the time having control of the appropriation. There was, in addition, if I remember correctly, a bill for the treatment of the sailors, which was paid from the marine-hospital fund.

I have now to speak of the facilities for the management of quarantine by the Treasury Department. That has been done so well by Surgeon Wyman that I probably need do but little more than refer to it by heads of paragraphs, from 10 to 12. First he mentions collectors of customs.

MR. PETTIBONE. I would like to have a brief of all documents referred to. Who can think of them with the hurry and bustle that we have got to go through with two weeks from now?

Surgeon-General HAMILTON. Collectors of customs are first mentioned. The same facilities which the Government has provided to prevent the smuggling of goods are those facilities which are best adapted for the prevention of the introduction of infected goods. That much must be admitted by all. The prevention of the introduction of anything that comes from sea naturally falls under the Customs Service. In England last year, when they had the cholera scare, the first duty was laid on the officers of the customs of ascertaining the condition of goods that were to be imported. Then we have the Revenue-Cutter Service, which is the coast-guard of the United States, with a fleet of vessels which traverses the coast.

MR. PETTIBONE. About how many vessels are in the service?

Surgeon-General HAMILTON. Thirty-seven, I think, besides harbor-tugs. They have regular stations, and make such complete patrol of the coast that smuggling is to-day an almost unknown thing, so far as any organized smuggling force is concerned.

In addition, we have the Marine-Hospital Service, with which the members of this committee are doubtless familiar. I have been informed, in relation to this Service and the hospitals, that it was said here that it would be "atrocious" to put yellow-fever patients in the marine hospitals. I do not know anybody that proposes to put such patients in regular marine hospitals. We never have done so, except by accident—when it could not be helped. Three of our officers have died of yellow fever, for they are usually the first to see the yellow fever. Yellow fever may get into hospitals, but it is the intention, and it has



been the practice, to furnish all the hospitals with tents, and the moment any contagious disease occurs in the hospital they are promptly removed to hospital tents, without the walls of the building. That is the best way to treat them.

In addition to the Marine-Hospital Service, we have, too, the Coast Survey, which is also under the direction of the Secretary of the Treasury; and all the commercial bureaus have heretofore been placed under the direction of the Secretary, because there has been no other Department of the Government to which the commercial services could be more properly assigned.

Medical officers proper and acting assistant surgeons are stationed at the ports along the coast, interior rivers, and the great lakes. It is their duty, under the regulations, to familiarize themselves with the local health laws of the place where they happen to be stationed, and to promptly report to the local authorities and to the Department at Washington any epidemic which may come to their knowledge. That is a-part of their duties by regulation, and has been for years.

Now, then, to sum up the statements that have been made in regard to this matter, I produced evidence, and if the committee desire, I will furnish them with a copy of the argument I made at the last meeting, containing the documents and the statements made in defence of the Brownsville quarantine. They are so overwhelming in weight and number that there cannot be any question but the officers who went there properly performed their duty. This will appear on the face of the record when it is examined. Claiming that success for the Service, it does away with the effort at disparagement which was forcibly lugged in as being in support of a bill which ought, in the first place, to have been argued on its own merits, without any reference to charges of that sort.

The impression has been sought to be made that medical men generally are in favor of the National Board of Health. That is erroneous; it is not true, for physicians in general care very little about the Board of Health. It is true that certain sanitarians, notably those who have been employed by this National Board of Health and their friends, organizations that, in some cases, have been temporarily supported by the funds appropriated in their aid—those organizations have favored the National Board of Health. The medical societies generally have not; the medical journals as a class have not, especially the leading ones. I might enumerate the Boston Medical and Surgical Journal, the New York Medical Journal, and the New York Medical Record, that have praised the quarantine service as conducted by the Marine-

Hospital Service. The Boston Journal went so far as to say, in a recent number, that in any other country but ours, a national board of health that had been snubbed by Congress in the manner that this has been, the members thereof would have promptly tendered their resignations.

Doctor VERDI. I know of ten thousand homeopathic physicians in this country who are in favor of the National Board of Health.

Surgeon-General HAMILTON. I want to ask the gentleman what bargain was made at the Public Health Association at Indianapolis, by which the homeopathic members were to be recognized by that association, in consequence of which they were to favor the National Board of Health?

Doctor VERDI. That is false from beginning to end.

Surgeon-General HAMILTON. I did not say there was such a bargain. I asked him to state what bargain was made. That is the popular impression.

Doctor VERDI. The popular impression is from your own brain.

Surgeon-General HAMILTON. I ask you whether there were not circulars sent out? You told me yourself you wanted to go there for that purpose; to see that they were represented in the association.

Doctor VERDI. It had no reference whatever to the National Board of Health. We wanted to be represented in a scientific body; that was all.

Surgeon-General HAMILTON. I knew you would have to admit that there was a preliminary question about the homeopathic physicians being represented in that body, and that after they were so represented they "indorsed" the Board. I received all the information I had from the gentleman himself.

Doctor VERDI. You are welcome to all the information you got from me.

Surgeon-General HAMILTON. It is not necessary for anybody to get hot on this question. It is a cool subject, and ought to be treated in a calm manner.

The practice of the National Board of Health of late is rather that of an obstructionist to carrying on the measures of the Government than a properly organized sanitary body. On the 8th of February, the secretary of the National Board of Health wrote a letter to the President of the United States, in which he tried to obstruct the operations of the Treasury Department, when that Department was endeavoring to find out the condition of certain ports, with reference to carrying on the quarantine of this coming season, money for which is already ap-

propriated and already in the hands of the Secretary of the Treasury. That letter, with the reply to it, I desire to put in evidence. It is as follows:

OFFICE OF THE NATIONAL BOARD OF HEALTH,  
Washington, D. C., February 8, 1884.

SIR: It is currently reported and believed that Surgeon-General Hamilton, of the Marine-Hospital Service, is now maintaining an inspecting officer in one or more foreign ports, and that he is about to undertake a sanitary survey of foreign ports on the Gulf of Mexico and elsewhere.

It is respectfully represented to the President that by the act of Congress approved March 3, 1879, constituting a National Board of Health, (Statutes at Large, vol. 20, page 484,) which act is still in force, it is required that "the Board shall make, or cause to be made, such special examinations and investigations at any place or places within the United States or at foreign ports, as they may deem best to aid in the execution of this act and the promotion of its objects." The second section of the act seems to constitute the National Board of Health the proper source of sanitary information when required by the several departments of the Government, "or whenever, in the opinion of the Board, such advice may tend to the preservation and improvement of the public health." It is further represented that the inspections above referred to as being made and about to be made by the Supervising Surgeon-General of the Marine-Hospital Service are not only not authorized by law, but that they call for a use of public funds not contemplated by law, and are a distinct encroachment on the prescribed rights and a direct interference with the prescribed duties of the National Board of Health, in which alone is vested not only the power to perform such service, but the discretion as to whether or not it shall be performed.

Very respectfully,

GEO. E. WARING, JR.,

*Secretary National Board of Health.*

To the PRESIDENT.

[Reply.]

TREASURY DEPARTMENT,  
*Office Supervising Surgeon-General U. S. M.-H. S.*  
Washington, February 13, 1884.

SIR: I have the honor to return herewith the letter of George E. Waring, jr., secretary of the National Board of Health, dated February 8, 1884, in which he states:

"It is currently reported and believed that Surgeon-General Hamilton, of the Marine-Hospital Service, is now maintaining an inspecting officer in one or more foreign ports, and that he is about to undertake a sanitary survey of foreign ports on the Gulf of Mexico and elsewhere."

It is further represented that "these inspectors are not only not authorized by law, but they call for a use of public funds not contemplated by law, and are a distinct encroachment on the prescribed rights

and a direct interference with the prescribed duties of the National Board of Health, in which alone is vested not only the power to perform such service, but the discretion as to whether or not it shall be performed.”

I have to say, in regard to this matter, that one inspector is now maintained at the expense of the fund for the prevention of the spread of contagious diseases, the use of which fund is discretionary with the President. This officer, Dr. Daniel M. Burgess, is stationed at Havana, Cuba. He was originally appointed by the National Board of Health, and when that body ceased to exercise authority over quarantine by reason of the expiration of its quarantine law, Doctor Burgess's services were continued. It is also proper to state that he was appointed to inspect vessels bound for United States ports upon the personal recommendation of Consul-General Badeau and the chief of the consular bureau of the State Department, Doctor St. Clair, who stated the well-known fact that yellow fever prevailed the year round in Havana, and that it was necessary that our port authorities should have bills of health on which they might rely for information as to the actual sanitary condition of the place at the time of the vessel's departure as well as of the vessel itself. No interference with the National Board of Health was contemplated by this course, nor does any result. The law does not say that the National Board of Health shall have sole power to ascertain the condition of foreign ports, but simply says, in effect, that they shall make “such special examinations and investigations of foreign ports as they may deem best.” Nobody has interfered with their making inspection of foreign ports, to my knowledge, nor is there any objection on the part of this Service or the Department which would prevent them making such investigation now, or at any time, nor from giving such advice as is contemplated by the law, if they wish to give it. The law relied on by Mr. Waring, it will be seen on reference, does not say that no other department or bureau or branch of the public service, when it thinks proper, shall ascertain the sanitary state of any foreign port except the National Board of Health, and it would, therefore, seem to be a captious criticism on the policy adopted which commends itself to every one, *i. e.*, that of taking proper precautionary measures to prevent the introduction of yellow fever, rather than by supinely sitting down to await its arrival.

The inspection of foreign Gulf-coast ports, which has been contemplated by me and approved by the Secretary, was simply to send the medical officer now on duty at Key West (who, by the way, speaks Spanish well, and before being admitted into this Service was employed by the National Board of Health as one of the Havana yellow-fever commission) to visit certain ports on the Gulf having commerce with the United States, for the purpose of reporting now their actual condition and to examine their hospital records of last year as to the admissions of yellow fever, so that, with this information in hand, the quarantine now under Government control could be managed more easily and, doubtless, more effectually.

Very respectfully, your obedient servant,

JOHN B. HAMILTON,

*Surgeon-General Marine-Hospital Service.*

Hon. CHAS. J. FOLGER,

*Secretary of the Treasury.*



Mr. Chairman, having claimed the success of this Service in its quarantine operations; having proved that success; having proved, by their own records, that the statements made affecting my personal character and professional reputation, or at least their reported statements, to be false, then I claim that the existing branches of the Government have already the facilities that are necessary for the proper management of this sanitary service, without appropriating a single additional dollar for salaries or employment of alleged experts, except so much as may be necessary for the direct accomplishment of that purpose. The Government now has the Navy Department Museum of Hygiene to carry on the work of sanitary investigation at home and abroad, and the Treasury Department to manage the quarantine. It has, therefore, all the machinery which is necessary, without rehabilitating the National Board of Health, thus creating additional officers to draw pay from the Government of the United States for work which can be better performed by other branches of the public service. This is, in brief, what I have to say on this subject.

Mr. DAVIS. I wish to inquire, in the event of this matter remaining in the hands of the Marine-Hospital Service, (this quarantine work,) whether you desire any enlargement, any further legislation?

Surgeon-General HAMILTON. I will answer by saying that the present law—that is to say, the one in the appropriation act—is the broadest that could possibly be put upon the statute-books, because the manner of its execution is entirely discretionary with the President. He, of course, is bound to use that discretion so it does not conflict with existing laws. With that exception, it is as broad as it can be devised. It will, however, expire with the life of the appropriation.

Mr. DAVIS. In relation to epidemic disease, getting into the interior of cities, when it might be very proper, perhaps absolutely necessary, to co-operate with State governments in checking the disease, do you think you have all the legislation you need, provided this is placed in your hands?

Surgeon-General HAMILTON. Nobody can lawfully interfere in a State without the request or consent of the Governor.

Mr. PETTIBONE. Suppose the Governor should call upon you?

Surgeon-General HAMILTON. Under this discretionary provision, it could be done.

Mr. DAVIS. You don't need any further legislation?

Surgeon-General HAMILTON. No, sir; not if the present law is continued in statutory form.



Mr. DAVIS. A good deal was done in Memphis by the National Government in assisting local and State boards?

Surgeon-General HAMILTON. That was done under specific acts of Congress to give aid to local boards.

Mr. DAVIS. If this matter should be left with you, do you think your department sufficiently empowered by law to do all that is necessary?

Surgeon-General HAMILTON. Yes, sir; under the present law, as long as the money holds out. When the appropriation is exhausted, re-enactment of the law would be necessary.

Mr. PETTIBONE. The present act while it lasts is sufficient?

Surgeon-General HAMILTON. Yes.

Mr. DAVIS. You don't ask for any increase of your powers in any direction?

Surgeon-General HAMILTON. No.

The CHAIRMAN. The power would be assumed, not granted by any legislation; but acting as you do, upon the application of local board and Governor, and with the co-operation or consent of the local authorities, you go in and assist them, but you have no power by legislation under any law to do so.

Surgeon-General HAMILTON. Not within the lines of a State, except under the conditions stated.

The CHAIRMAN. Have you any right to draw a cordon on the line between two States? Supposing in one State an infectious disease exists, and you want to stop it?

Surgeon-General HAMILTON. It has to be in one State or the other, unless both States should make the request.

Mr. DAVIS. Has the Government, under the present law, power to enter the States and suppress an epidemic?

Surgeon-General HAMILTON. I reply to the gentleman's question by saying that the jurisdiction of the Revenue-Cutter Service, so far as the customs service is concerned, and the right to search vessels, extends for twelve miles from shore. Within that twelve miles a revenue-cutter can search any vessel, make any kind of examination that is required; and it was actually done last season. We examined them and sent them to quarantine stations without their coming into the shore at all or being subject to the operation of local law.

Mr. DAVIS. That don't touch the point. I spoke of when the disease got inside of your lines; and I suppose it will enter our large cities first. Then do you feel, in a case like that, that the General Govern-

ment has powers which would authorize you to exercise authority? Would that be your province under the present law? Could you perform that duty?

Surgeon-General HAMILTON. We did that. That was done in Texas; it was done in Florida; in both instances at the request of the Governors of the States.

Mr. DAVIS. And you think there is sufficient law to do so?

Surgeon-General HAMILTON. That was the opinion of the Secretary of the Treasury.

Mr. DAVIS. Don't you think you can deal with this whole matter, internal as well as external?

Surgeon-General HAMILTON. No; except where the Governor of a State, just as he, in time of war or famine, would announce that he himself was unable to care for that State.

Mr. PETTIBONE. They are pretty apt to do so where they need it.

Surgeon-General HAMILTON. They never failed yet.

Mr. THOMAS SIMONS, (Assistant Attorney-General of the United States.) I have no concern personally in this matter, except to know what charges are brought against the National Board of Health. Being a member, I simply wish to know whether we have heard it all?

Surgeon-General HAMILTON. If the gentleman desires me to reply to that, I can do so.

The CHAIRMAN. It is to be supposed that the gentleman has said all that he has to say by way of refutation.

Surgeon-General HAMILTON. I reserve the right, if anything more is said which reflects upon me, to bring in additional evidence to refute it.

Doctor SMART. [Reading.] On Thursday last——

The CHAIRMAN. There is not time to hear you read the letter——

Mr. SIMONS. I would like a copy of the argument, to know what to reply to. It is a hardship to be compelled to meet charges from memory.

Surgeon-General HAMILTON. I do not think that the Assistant Attorney-General of the United States has had any particular hardship played upon him. I was not present when the charges were made against me, and was obliged to plead to hearsay charges. I think it is the height of ridiculousness to plead the "baby act" in relation to this matter.

Doctor VERDI here explained relative to his having been paid \$300 for an essay. He remarked, if there was anything he ever did to the

credit of humanity, this is the thing; that he had to make investigation of all the German, English, and American authorities, a great labor by night and day, to produce a satisfactory report. When he charged \$10 a day for thirty days for writing ten pages, the labor covered more than that time. The report is upon a subject of the most importance there is before your country, the question of meat in Europe. He asserted that he proved by statistics that \$50,000,000 a year was lost from diseased cattle, one-half of which could be saved by an expenditure of \$20,000 or \$30,000. Doctor Verdi closed by saying that it had been a great labor, for which he had been paid \$300, which, if he had done it in private practice, would have brought him \$3,000. He said that sanitary science had been his study for fifteen years; that he had never earned a dollar except honestly, and what he claimed from the United States was simply for services rendered.

Doctor SMART. Mr. Chairman, the charges and specifications which were brought before the committee by Doctor Hamilton are all of a character similar to that which Doctor Verdi has referred to. All can be readily explained. It was not the National Board of Health that paid the money, it was the law which did it. When a member of the National Board of Health is appointed to any duty under the orders of the Board, the law requires that he be paid at a per diem of \$10. Doctor Verdi occupied thirty days; but it was the law. All the other points as against the National Board of Health are easily explained.

There was one charge of a more serious nature. These were frivolous. It was charged that this Board—that the appropriation fund of this Board is a corruption fund to be distributed among local boards, with the understanding that those boards shall support the hand that fed them. The only specification which he brings forth to sustain the charge is that, after the epidemic at Pensacola had ceased, a requisition was sent to the National Board of Health for \$2,000.

Surgeon-General HAMILTON. Will you allow me to correct you. I stated in support of that statement that the fund appropriated in aid of local boards of health was in effect a corruption fund, that was all; and that officials of the State boards of health were employed by the National Board of Health.

Doctor SMART. It is charged that the money was sent to Pensacola and distributed among the doctors or the friends of the board in that city. The money which was sent to Pensacola during the epidemic amounted to about \$9,000. That money was disbursed upon bills which had attached to them sub-vouchers signed by every person who

received the money, chiefly nurses. In addition to those sub-vouchers, the bills were sworn to by the secretary of the board of health of Pensacola. The bills amounted to \$9,100. This gentlemen here, Doctor Bailhache, a member of the National Board of Health, and at the same time a member of the Marine-Hospital Service, saw every one of those bills, and approved them prior to their presentation to the Treasury for payment. There was one bill sent in by a doctor. The board sent a medical officer belonging to the Navy to investigate the origin of the epidemic. During his investigation he became sick with yellow fever. He was attended by Doctor Hargis. Long after the epidemic was over, Hargis sent in his bill to the Navy Department for \$150 for professional services rendered to one of its members. As that officer was on detail, the Navy Department considered that the bill should be paid by the National Board of Health, and it was referred to the National Board. They thought it right that Doctor Hargis should be paid and it was ordered to be paid, and the member from the Marine-Hospital Service approved the payment.

Surgeon BAILHACHE. I deny "approving" payment of any of those bills.

Doctor SMART. There was no requisition sent from Pensacola for \$2,000, no requisition approved by the National Board of Health from Pensacola; and this man, (Surgeon Bailhache,) who took so much interest in the proceedings on last Thursday as to correct his superior when he made a mistake in regard to the price paid for the barge "Selden"—he showed his interest by correcting his superior and saying \$3,000—this same gentleman knew that no \$2,000 had been paid to the people of Pensacola, and yet he did not make any correction.

Surgeon-General HAMILTON. The letter which I submitted was from the mayor of Pensacola making the charge. I presented that letter as my authority for the statement.

Mr. WARING. I have my remarks written out, and should be glad to submit them for the use of the committee, rather than to take up their time. I want to say that they contain distinct charges and accusations against Doctor Hamilton, that I should prefer to deliver in his presence.

The CHAIRMAN. Are they new charges?

Mr. WARING. There are a number of new charges, based on statements that Doctor Hamilton has made before the committee. One of them accuses me of a nefarious act, and accuses the Board by implication. There are others which I know to be absolutely false which he has presented here for the purpose of influencing the minds of the com-



mittee, and which we are ready to dispose of in such manner that no member of the committee can doubt that we are right and he is wrong.

Surgeon-General HAMILTON. After the gentleman's remarks, I should like to have—if the committee are going to investigate me in regard to this matter—I should like to have the gentleman make his statement. What I said about him I have here. That was, that the Board had employed him to write on the subject of sewer-traps, flush-tanks, &c., while he was holding patents on those very things. I did not accuse him of dishonesty. I asked the committee to draw their own conclusions. I made no charge. I make none now.

Adjourned to Thursday, 28th of February.





WA U58re 1884

63060070R



NLM 05131226 6

NATIONAL LIBRARY OF MEDICINE